



College of Arts and Social Sciences

Master of Arts in Development Studies

**INTEGRATED GRADUATION PROGRAM AND ITS EFFECT ON POVERTY
REDUCTION IN GISAGARA DISTRICT, MUGANZA SECTOR 2018- 2020.**

NIKUZE Aimeline

Reg. N°: 220004423

**A Dissertation Submitted as a Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Award of
Degree of Masters of Arts in Development Studies at University of Rwanda
(UR).**

Supervisor: Dr. Ismael BUCHANAN

HUYE, OCTOBER 2021

DEDICATION

Dedicated:

To my children;

My relatives,

Friends and colleagues

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to express my profound gratitude to the University of Rwanda Managers and Lectures who taught me for their sacrifice and tirelessly devoting time and efforts to enrich, broaden and deepen my knowledge over this intake.

I express my sincere gratitude to supervisor Dr. Ismael BUCHANAN for his devotion in supervising this work up to the end. This research could have probably not been completed without his professional and instructive supervision and guidance. His advice was most invaluable and numerous discussions engaged in during the course of this study were most fruitful and enlightening.

I express my acknowledgement to the university and different lecturers who have supported me during my studies through different circumstances that arise my instincts of social and academic phenomenon.

Special thanks are due to my children again for their encouragement in my distress during my studies. Moreover, I am deeply indebted to my colleagues for their wholehearted love, supports and unity during our studies and the populations, who sacrificed their time in providing me with the information to make the research successful. The great thanks to all participants who have contributed in this research from the beginning up to the completion of it.

Thank you very much.

ABSTRACT

Around the countryside, people's economy has increased to the pleasant level of development. The government of Rwanda have established many developmental programs to lift poor people from vicious circle of poverty. The Integrated Graduation program has been established to reduce extreme poverty in Gisagara district. This program is used to reduce extreme poverty among the citizens who live in vicious circle of poverty in order to have good living condition. Different perspectives from some scholars highlighted how graduation program is like vehicle to poverty reduction and socioeconomic development of disadvantaged people.

The objective of this study is to found out the role the Integrated Graduation Program in reduction of extreme poverty in Gisagara District; to analyze the impact of Integrated Graduation Program in economic development of community in Muganza sector. The research also wanted to find out how Integrated Graduation Program increased the livelihood of people in Muganza sector and to highlight obstacles that hinders the development of people in Muganza sector.

The qualitative design used in this research, interview, focus group discussions and documentations were all used. Both primary and secondary data were conducted and the respondents were selected purposively. The data from respondents have shown that graduation program not only contribute to socio-economic development of citizens. The graduation provides cash transfers, assets transfers that helped beneficiaries to be able to access their needs. The participants appreciate the trainings offered on how to prepare nitrous food and different technique of farming. This give them opportunity own livestock either small or big animals that help them access to market and manure that increase agricultural production. However, the district still is one of the districts with big number of people in extreme poverty in Rwanda despite different graduation program implemented there. From this, it is recommended that the implementation of graduation program needs serious execution, follow up, audition and evaluation in both implementers and beneficiaries so that supports provided to them should be more effective. Moreover, the collaboration between government institutions and nongovernment agencies should be strong to ensure effectiveness and efficiency of the program.

Keywords: Integrated Graduation Program, Concern Worldwide, Poverty Reduction

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION	ii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	x
CHAPTER ONE	1
1.2. Background of the study.....	1
1.3. Statement of the research problem	4
1.4. Study objectives.....	4
1.4.1. General objective	4
1.4.2. Specific Objectives	4
1.5. Research questions.....	5
1.5.1. Main questions	5
1.5.2. Sub-questions.....	5
1.6. The study significance	5
1.7. Scope of study.....	5
1.8 Limitations of the Study	6
1.9. Organization of the study.....	6
CHAPTER TWO.....	7
Review of Literature and Theoretical Framework	7
2.1. Introduction.....	7
2.2. Key definitions used in the research.....	7
2.2.1. The poverty	7
2.3. Theoretical framework of Aids and poverty reduction.....	8
2.3.1. Dependency theory	9
2.3.2. The political realism.....	11

2.3.3. Theory of change	12
2.5. Graduation program.....	15
2.5.1. Key activities of the Graduation Program.....	16
2.5.2. Gender inequality and the Graduation approach.....	19
2.6. Overview of Concern Worldwide Rwanda.....	20
2.6.1. Concern worldwide graduation program in Rwanda	22
2.6.2. The five essential components of Concern’s Graduation Model	23
2.6.3. Improving the productive capacity of extremely poor households through Concern Worldwide Rwanda.....	24
2.6.4. Making Graduation Programs/Concern worldwide a Gender Transformative in Rwanda. 25	
2.6.4. summary of the literature	26
CHAPTER THREE.....	27
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	27
3.1. Introduction.....	27
3.2. Study design	27
3.3. Administrative Units of the study area	27
3.4. Study area and study population.....	28
3.5. Sample size and sample techniques	29
3.6. Source of data	30
3.7. Data collection tools	31
3.7.1. Documentation	31
3.7.2. The questionnaire.....	31
3.7.3. Interview	32
3.7.4. Focus group discussions.....	32
3.8. The process of data collection	32
3.9. Data Analysis and Reporting.....	33

3.8. Ethical consideration	33
3.8. Summary of the chapter.....	34
CHAPTER FOUR	35
DATA THE PRESENTATION	35
4.1. Introduction.....	35
4.2. The characteristics of respondents.....	35
4.3. The statements from respondents about concern worldwide in Muganza sector and their living conditions through the objectives of the research.....	38
4.3.1. The impact of Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda in extreme poverty reduction in Gisagara District.	38
4.3.2. The impact of Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda in economic development of community in Muganza sector.....	41
4.3.3. The contribution of Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda to increase the livelihood of people in Muganza sector through different activities.	44
4.3.4. The process of selecting concern worldwide beneficiaries in Muganza sector.	47
4.3.5. The challenges that hinder the development in Muganza sector	50
CHAPTER FIVE	53
DISCUSSIONS	53
5.1 Introduction	53
5.2 The overview of graduation program from participants.....	53
5.3 The impacts analysis of graduation program to beneficiaries	54
CHAPTER SIX	56
SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	56
6.1. Introduction.....	56
6.2. Summary of the study	56
6.3. Conclusion	57
6.4. Recommendations.....	57

REFERENCES.....	59
APPENDICES.....	64

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Graduation Criteria and Graduation Indicators.....	17
Table 2: That illustrates target population.....	29
Table 3: That illustrates the sample size of the population of the study.	30
Table 4: The demographic characteristics of respondents	35

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ADB: Asian Development Bank.

BRAC's: Base Realignment And Closure

CC: Cell Council

CDAs: Community Development Animators

CDC: Community Development Committee

CEC: Cell Executive Committee composed of ten members.

CFPR: Challenging the Frontiers of Poverty Reduction

CGAP: Consultative Group to Assist the Poor

CLP: Chars Livelihoods Program

CPRC: Chronic Poverty Research Centre

EDPRS: Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategies

EICV: Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey

FDI: Foreign Direct Investment

GBV: Gender Based Violence

HDI: Human Development Index

M&E: Monitoring and Evaluations

NGOs: Non-Governmental Organizations

NISR: National Institute of Statistics

NWC: National Women's Council

NYC: National Youth Council

PAC: Political and Administrative Committee

SC: Sector Council

SEC: Sector Executive Committee

UNDP: United Nations Development Program's

UNRISD: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development

VUP: Vision Umurenge program

WDI: World Bank's Development Indicators

CHAPTER ONE

General Introduction

1.1. Introduction.

In order to have access to development, the government need to set the strategies and programs that increase the living condition of citizens. The government of Rwanda has set policies and programs to increase the living conditions of its population. This chapter focused on the background of the study, problem statement, study objectives, research questions, significance of the study, scope of the study finally determines the organization of the study.

1.2. Background of the study

The Republic of Rwanda is a landlocked country accounted with almost 12 million people as stated by National Statistics of Rwanda (NISR, 2019). It is also one of the African countries with high population density of 458.75 people/ km², whereby 40% of the population are under 30 years old while 89% of them live in agriculture (RPHC, 2012). This makes Rwanda one of the poor countries worldwide with high people live in poverty and who need supports for the development. according to World Bank Development Indicator, Rwanda is among 25 poorest countries in Africa with Gross Domestic Product per Capita of 689 \$ in 2016 (UNDP,2017); it was as well 167 in 182 countries in the United Development Program's (UNDP), Human Development Index in 2016 (Rashidghalam, 2017).

According to National Institute of Statistics (NISR, 2018), the people who live below the poverty line have dropped to 58% from 44.9% in 2011 to 39.1% in 2014. This shows that Rwanda's economy has increased due to different programs and policies that help people to lift them from poverty. This also shows that through these policies and programs, the living conditions of people would increase to the sufficient level. World Bank stated that "The issue of poverty is a global phenomenon, which affects continents, nations and people differently. There is no nation that is absolutely free from poverty. The main difference is the intensity and prevalence, which means the highest level of social insecurity, violence, social unrest and generally unacceptable low standard of living. Thus, poverty is a condition in which a person is deprived of, or lacks the essentials for minimum standard of living. Poverty has been defined as the inability to attain a minimum standard of living" (World Bank Report, 1990). Many Rwandans limited to as of the countries of the world, whereby the access to education, health

insurance and increase of living standards become problems though there are different programs and policies from government or other organizations either governmental or non-governmental to improve the living conditions of people.

Among the non-governmental organization, include Concern worldwide graduation program that was established with to concern to the vulnerable people in different countries around the world including Rwanda, to alleviate extreme poverty that dominate many its people. Government of Rwandan has settled different programs associated with different strategic ways of sustainable development. However, in many countries, there occur some constrains such as lack of coordination of government agencies during implementation and designing which lead to excess of bias and insecurity. There is also lack of continuity and no enough transparency or accountability. (Concern World Wide, 2019). This causes many countries to remain in vicious circle of poverty for long time and the programs established there be ineffective to their objectives and purpose.

The Graduation program is growing fast especially in Rwandan countries whereby graduations programs are being established all over the country to help citizens from poverty. According to the graduation program reports in 2016, “over 82% of projects have integrated the Graduation Approach into their organization’s mainstream strategies reflecting the fact that graduation is becoming an integral part of government’s social protection systems and regular NGO and donor programming. Over 2,500,000 households reached to date with graduation programs in 2016. The average size of a program is approximately 42,475 households and the median size is 1,350 households indicating that programs widely vary in size ranging from a mere 150 households to 675,000 households (reaching approximately 3-5 million people Worldwide” (World Bank 2020). This is great step of poverty reduction to the countries whose people live under poverty line. The programs set many strategic ways of helping people depending their environment, living condition and what can help them from poverty.

Concern worldwide was established in Rwanda in 1994 genocide against Tutsis, and put in practice the graduation program called “unleashing the productive capacities of extreme poor people in 2011. Concern worldwide graduation program, according to government’s economic development and poverty reduction strategies, is projected to reduce extreme poverty. Through enhancing off-farm employment, participating target groups with labor market and giving them supports such as cash transfer to help them have better livelihood. However, concern worldwide graduation program

transformed the living condition of people around 3,000 households in four district of Rwanda, which are Huye, Nyaruguru, Kigali, Nyamagabe and Gisagara districts. The program is built on vision 2020 Umurenge Program (VUP, 2020) and gets lessons from different institutions (CGAP, 2016). Works from these programs have improved the awareness of concern worldwide to establish effective policies and provide supports that are more effective to the reduction of poverty on the Rwandan citizens.

Concern Worldwide set up the graduation program in two districts of south province, which are Huye and Gisagara districts, in 2011 to help extreme poor households through cash transfers; skills development and assets transfers, to improve the living condition and savings to increase investment of beneficiaries (Concern Worldwide Graduation Program, 2018). These programs have made great stride on poverty reduction in these districts and affect positively the living standards of the people. The Graduation program's target is to support the extremely poor households, whereby they receive cash transfers for 18 months with the average of 18000 Rwandan francs per months depending on the households size, they are also trained by community development animators (CDAs) how to use and save the money received to help them in the future and increase their awareness on development activities. . Households also receive coaching by volunteer Community Development Animators (CDAs), on prioritizing cash transfer spending and savings plans and on other program-related activities that can help them lift from poverty and increase their awareness on developmental activities.

The households for Graduation Program are those who were classified in the lowest two Ubudehe categories and they are eligible to it confirmed by the community. The people is allowed when they have at least one member family who is able to work; when they have no land to cultivate or have little; have no cattle or income generating activities, no member who have finished high school or vocational certificate and if they are not supported by any other program (Concern Worldwide Graduation Program, 2015). The study is going to analyze the impact of how Graduation Program especially Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda has reduced poverty in Gisagara, Muganza sector District.

1.3. Statement of the research problem

Rwanda population is estimated of 12, 2 million people with the increase rate of around 2.3%.¹ This makes the government to increase partnership with other countries as well as different institution to increase the wellbeing of population and job creation within community. The government of Rwanda have adopted the graduation program to increase the wellbeing of people and the poverty trend. The willingness and strong buy-in of the political leadership, has ensured the success of development interventions. The government of Rwanda has set out many programs working with the people to eradicate extreme poverty. The collaboration with different organizations and institutions with government which require huge costs of money to invest in the program was the most concern of the government. The graduation program has been established as the source of poverty reduction, however, the poverty level is still high in Rwandan community especially in Gisagara district Muganza sector. According to the data released by national Institute of Statistics, Gisagara district is one of the district that have big number of poor people with many developmental programs implementation. The access to infrastructure and the number of people who access easily basic needs is still a low. Most of its people live in agriculture which is advanced, ignorance among its people with limited access to infrastructures. The dependence on one of the family, population increases and unemployment showed low speed in poverty reduction. This hint some suspicious in planning, implementation, and little concern in evaluation of the program development.

1.4. Study objectives

1.4.1. General objective

The main objective of this study is to found out the role the Integrated Graduation Program in reduction of extreme poverty in Gisagara District.

1.4.2. Specific Objectives

- To analyze the impact of Integrated Graduation Program in economic development of community in Muganza sector.
- To find out how Integrated Graduation Program increased the livelihood of people in Muganza sector.
- To highlight obstacles that hinders the development of people in Muganza sector.

¹(<https://www.africaw.com/major-problems-facing-rwanda-today>).

1.5. Research questions

1.5.1. Main questions

What is impact of Integrated Graduation Program in extreme poverty reduction in Gisagara District, Muganza sector?

1.5.2. Sub-questions

- How the Integrated Graduation Program does contribute in economic development of community in Muganza sector?
- How Integrated Graduation Program does increased the livelihood of people in Muganza sector?
- What are obstacles that hinder the development of the people in Muganza sector?

1.6. The study significance

This study would give a clear picture of works done by development program particularly Integrated Graduation Program. The findings inform the Government of Rwanda about the role of graduation program to reduce of extreme poverty. Furthermore, the study findings is projected to provide necessary information to academicians and scientists who need to undertake researches in this domain to do further research on development programs and how they play vital role in development of the country.

Both national and international NGOs as well as other agencies will get strength on how to overcome extreme poverty by focusing the most vulnerable people in community and increasing concerns on the disadvantaged people. Finally, this research will qualify the researcher to complete her masters studies.

1.7. Scope of study

The study “*Analysis of the Impact of Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Poverty Reduction in Gisagara District, Muganza sector 2018- 2020*” has choice in time, space and costs. The works will focus on Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda focusing on Gisagara District, Muganza sector. The study will be conducted in Rwanda, Gisagara district, Muganza sector whereby the program is working on and where it has many beneficiaries, to find out if the information needed to complete the study was used effectively.

1.8 Limitations of the Study

This study faced different restrictions that limited the researcher during data collection. Given that this study aimed to assess the role of graduation program to reduce extreme poverty, the study focused on assessing human needs and people's wellbeing instating in social and economic phenomenon. However, to get as many as people to consult was too difficult because most of them do not get enough free time to talk and it was difficult to access to them because spending much of their time searching for their survival. Living in dispersed area was too challenging that researcher could not reach to them all. This limited her to have many respondents to ask during data collection. The pandemic disease also became big hindrance to researcher avoid to be affected as policies and regulations. Moreover, study assess social status and living condition of community, which is not possible to study in such limited time we were allowed to while it has too much to analyze and interprets.

1.9. Organization of the study

The research is organized into five sections each of which constitutes a chapter. The first chapter is composed of Introduction, which highlights the background, problem of study, objectives, scope, significance and limitations. The second chapter is Literature Review details the definition of key concepts and highlights scholarly findings on the impact of Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda on reduction of extreme poverty, secondary literature from both national and global perspective.

The third chapter is Methodology, which describes the methodology, data collection tools and techniques used to analyze data while investigating the research problem. The fourth chapter is Research Findings; it describes and analytically argues on the study results compared to the existing literature. Lastly, the chapter five is Conclusions and recommendations, which summarize the study findings, the researcher's recommendations and conclusion based on the study findings.

CHAPTER TWO.

Review of Literature and Theoretical Framework

2.1. Introduction

The chapter is composed of definition of key concepts, different theories and empirical reviews, the gaps and conceptual frameworks about graduation programs particularly concern international and its contribution to poverty reduction. The aim of this chapter is to explain some challenges, develop knowledge, and establish the needs for additional research. This section with focus on the reviews and studies concerned to graduation programs particularly in Southern province, Gisagara district whereby people are being supported to lift themselves from poverty through graduation program.

2.2. Key definitions used in the research

2.2.1. The poverty

The term poverty has been defined differently by different researchers but all definition falls on the subject that it is the state whereby the people lacks financial resources or basic needs for people to survive. Poverty means that people has low and insufficient income to satisfy their needs. World Bank (1997), defined poverty basing on per capita income, while the fundamentalists define poverty as the lack of basic needs for people to survive. This means that poverty is the inability to access basic needs or get what people need in their daily lives.

The UNDP (2006) “has stated the human development method by theorizing the notion of overall human poverty and income poverty”. The United Nations Development Programs from the above approach, it developed other Human Development Approach. This is one of the approaches that developed the notion of poverty in very wide ways. The Human Development Approach was developed by UNDP in 1990 to show how poverty can be measured within community, or referring to human development indexes (UNDP, 2006). Other term of poverty clarification is Capability approach, this approach was developed by Amartya Sen to explain the way in which poverty hinder or deprives the ability of someone to access to what they want. Sen (1990) stated that “reflect a person’s freedom or ability to choose the way (s) he wishes to live. These include the capacity to be free from hunger, to become educated, and to earn a decent living and as such, they are interconnected and mutually reinforcing.” Most poor people have many difficulties in capability

deprivation simultaneously. This means that they are unable to access education, they have limited and no nutritious food, limited to human rights and low income and living conditions (CPRC,2004).

Refers to the capability approach, highlights poverty as hindrance to fundamental capability of human being, which shows level of freedom people need to reach to something more important to them. However, the capability does not only means the ability to achieve on a given goals but also the range of work they are likely to have. As stated by Sen (1993:31), “The capability approach is based on a view of living as combination of various ‘doings and beings,’ with quality of life to be assessed in terms of the capability to achieve valuable functioning.” This means that one’s needs to survive are not the same as someone else’s needs to be considered as poor or rich. Sometimes other theorists criticize these approaches because they focused on one others sides, where they focus on spending, income, other related factors, though the way of saving are different in different households because every household save when is needed.

2.3. Theoretical framework of Aids and poverty reduction

Poverty is a big problem to the community development especially in the developing countries where there are many obstacles of economic development. The term poverty is among the biggest problem, which dominates the world nowadays (Gueshengwe et al., 2020). The research conducted by United Nations Development Program have found out in 2019 people who were around 1.3 billion from 101 countries of the world lived in poverty line (UNDP, 2019).

Therefore, “the 2030 Global Agenda for Sustainable Development Goals has called for the elimination of all forms of poverty everywhere in the world” (Koehler, 2017). According to different theorists, this poverty would be eliminated through different international aids, which can be provided in different form. However, as stated by Fernando, (2011) there are different positions on what the international Aids are and their impacts on poverty reduction. Though there are controversies whereby some explain it as it the tool for poverty reduction while others view it as the cause of worse than good, and others take it as the way of poverty reduction but refers to the country conditions (Fernando, 2011). There are some approaches of poverty in multidimensional ways. These approaches were developed by different theorists to define poverty in the ways that can be understood in different sector or life.

2.3.1. Dependency theory

The dependency theory is the theory whereby the people in a periphery depend on the core. This dependence can influence the people to stand still waiting for the supports from the core instead of searching how to get what they need. According to the dependency theorists, and world system theory the international aid is the way of limiting the development of developing countries through promotion of inequality in access to resources or capital worldwide (Wood, 1986). The dependence theory were developed in the late 1950 when some of the researchers where overwhelmed by the fact that the core countries have failed to help periphery countries from poverty, particularly in Africa since they knew they played part in the underdevelopment of African countries.

According to foreign aid theory, it is better that development of the underdeveloped and developing countries starts from indigenous knowledge and efforts rather that from foreign aid. Additionally, there are different difficulties and conditions that come alongside with this foreign aid that make the dependent countries continue to depend on them. Therefore, it is advisable for the countries that receive foreign aid to be more attentive to the conditions of donors because they may be do it by their own motive not the motive of countries that receive aid (Kumar P., A., 2005). African countries received more than one trillion as development aid for fifty years, which undermined the development of the continent instead of lifting them from poverty (Moyo, 2009).

The dependency theory was developed in 1950, by Raul Prebisch who was the director of United Nations economic commissions for Latin America with his colleague who wanted to show how the economic growth of developed countries could not lead to the development of poor countries. The theory is focused on how the rich countries extract the resources in poor countries to be used in their developmental activities while the poor countries are still suffering. The persistence of the situation remains to enrich well-off nations, while the poorer nations are extremely disadvantaged. Being given aids for African countries is the ways of undermining their level of thinking and continue to depend on the living from abroad, while they are being supported on aids from Africa. The dependence theory states also the aids conditionality whereby the core give conditions on how the money provided should be used which also continue to undermine the development of the developing countries. According to Easterly (2006), foreign aid is the “unforced transfer of resources from one country to another with the aim of benefitting the country receiving the aid.” This means that one country transfer the money to another country for receiver’s advantage thought it is not how it done between Africa and western countries because Africa still suffers while the western countries are

enjoying the resources from Africa. Ajayi (2000), also improves that foreign aid as financial supports provided to a given countries or institutions that have many problems related to poverty, which can be cash or other kind of support. Todaro (2003), also stated that aid is a flow of capital from developed to less developed countries to help them lift themselves from a given crisis. This aid from developed countries to underdeveloped ones have helped the developing countries in some extent but also caused the countries to live with the culture begging or waiting from outside which hindered the development of the developing countries. According to Kumar, most of the developing countries depends on foreign aid to meet their loss or inadequate capital, foreign exchanges and technical knowledge because of their unfavorable economy to promote foreign trade and attraction of foreign investment (Kumar, 2005).

Those who are for foreign aid claimed that since money, foreign exchange and technical knowledge are limited to the development of underdeveloped countries; while also their internal economic structure are unable to provide those resources. Then foreign aid can play crucial role in development of these countries and help to eradicate the blockages, while those against it state that are like liche that used by developed countries to take away even those little ones from developing countries, which means that foreign aid does not help developing countries at all rather benefit the core (Matunhu, 2011). These antagonists stated that since there is absence of indigenou efforts and participation on the used and implementation of developmental programs.

According to Matunhu (2011), Africa is still politically, economically and socially dependent on western and America through the money transferred to the African countries as aid. This continue to hinder the development of Africa because they fear to set policies or programs that can help in development of the continent because they think that they can lose aid. Those aid from wealthy nations to underdeveloped increased yearly whereby from 1960s to 2011 it raised to 46 billion US dollars (Kabonga 2015). Thorough and rigorous appreciation of literature on donor aid and dependency theory was done to bring to the fore the intimate relationship between donor aid and dependency theory (Kabonga 2017). This is why the study seeks to assess the role of Concern Worldwide as one of the strategic way of aid provided to the Rwandan poor people on poverty reduction.

2.3.2. The political realism

The political realists state that aids are the tools used after cold wars with the purpose of persuading the political judgments of countries who received it. The aid is considered as the strategies used to improve the socio-economic development of developing countries, as the means of shaping and structuring the social, political and economic living condition of developing nations. There poverty is the state when a given individual is unable to access the basic needs. Among the stated basic needs includes shelter, food, clothing, and access to water and sanitation (Streeton et al, 1981). Once people are unable to get these primary needs, it means that they are in the poverty situation.

The poverty is measured in some extent by low expenditure or by limited income of the country. The basic approach begins with the lack of food which as minimal needs for a healthy life to shelter, clothing and sanitation. Poor countries live in vicious circle of poverty because infertile, malaria infected, hot and most of the time landlocked which become difficult for them to be productive (Sachs, 2005). However, this is not the reasons for them to be poor, because even the wealth nations have no favorable climate at all which is more than of Africa; rather extraction of African resources and foreign aid conditions are the main causes of poverty in African countries.

According to political realist Mosley et al (2004), some of the keys to poverty reduction include the international aid, inequality reduction and anti-corruption policies. The uses of aids in whatever form it may reach to the recipient has a positive affect their living condition and lift them from poverty to social and economic changes. As stated by Burnside & Dollar (200), “in order for aids to be positive, there must be good policies in the developing countries in terms of taxes, trade and public finance, otherwise aids have little effect.” These are some of strategic solutions of poor countries to cut the lopes of dependence to foreign aid, which hinder their development. With the respect of the above criteria, the country can experience development at any costs without depending on any other countries. The World Bank is the main stakeholder of foreign aid using the strategies such as provision of technical supports, use of safety nets, and provision of nutrition programs and giving them supports on agricultural and food security strategies, but somehow providing zero interests to the receivers (World Bank, 2012).

According to political realism theory, the international aid in whatever form it may take like concern worldwide, it plays big role in poverty reduction for the recipient countries if they distribute it well to the people who need it in fair, transparent and use of participative way. The notion of economic

wellbeing also which related to the physical quality of life or welfare for which consumption of not only food but also clothing, shelter and other necessities are important. According to Citro & Michael (1995), he visionary stated that poverty “pertains to people’s lack of economic resources like ‘money, or near-money income’ for consumptions of economic goods and services like ‘food, housing, clothing, and transports.” This is the category of people who are unable to access these basic needs in their daily life, and these make them poor.

The fundamental level of economic wellbeing, the absolute poverty shows the lack of basic needs for people to survive, while the wealthy are defined as having ability to access freedom. The absolute poverty deals with lack of the primary necessities for people to survive such as food, shelter, cloths, education but poverty in general deals with the broad and tackle on inadequate income and other non-physical aspects of life (MacPherson & Silburn1998). The aid that come in form of program like Integrated graduation programme have lifted the people particularly in Gisagara district in very significant ways. The livestock distribution such as cows, goats and pigs as well as giving beneficiaries amount of money monthly in a given period of time so that they can make business for their own needs.

2.3.3. Theory of change

The theory of change sates development as the process through which a given community comes from bad to good condition. This means that development is the socio-economic changes of a given people or community.

The theory of change is the process from traditional beliefs and associated leading ideas, values to modern ones (Serrat O, 2013). It is the collection of economic, cultural, environment, political and religious forces, but more ofter=n that not in co-evolutionary combination (Serrat O, 2013). This means that theory of change focuses on the changes from bad to good life condition of people within community. Every community needs change in order to develop; the development must follow social, economic, cultural and political changes in order to get to that development. Without changes, there is no development, the foreign aid come as the result to end poverty and help in development of countries state the obstacles of development and in what situation (Serrat O, 2013).

Through this theory, different governments have stated many programs to change the wellbeing of their citizens. These programs are influenced by non-governmental organizations that work all over the world to help governments to implement these programs. The Integrated Graduation program is

one of the program that have played the crucial role in improving people's wellbeing worldwide and have changed their lives to a significant level.

Theory of change is the approach that influence participation in given activities which lead to critical thinking to be design, implementation and evaluation of initiatives such as strategy, program or project planned to nurture developing, projectable and transformative changes (ADB. 2008). This theory explains how changes can be achieved in collaboration and participation of all community members, in transparence and equal participation. The Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Gisagara district has brought changes in this district through the implementation of different policies and programs in order to attain the development and lift the people from poverty. Since there occur changes on people's socio-economic living condition, it is said that there is development in Gisagara district through the provision of different supports from Concern Worldwide Rwanda.

The changes that occur in a given community is the fact evidence that there is development if that changes show good impact to the community people in that area. According to Harries E., et al (2014), the theory of change us instrument used to describe the needs of community and the ways to reach to that needs to do for better development of the community. This theory is used for organizations of all kind to provide supports to the community, to campaigning organizations, to funders. If there is a needs within community, there must be addressed by the community members because they are the beneficiaries of that changes. In Gisagara district, the needs for development, through Concern Worldwide Rwanda, have been addressed by the people beneficiaries to reach to its success.

This is the theory considered by researcher to assess and analyze the development of members of Concern Worldwide Rwanda, the branch of Muganza. Among the benefits of theory of change, there is to help teams work together to achieve common objectives of a project and its aims; make projects more effective and productive to the community.

2.4. Poverty situation in Rwanda

The poverty in Rwanda is caused by different problems that affects the community particularly on land, demography, environmental degradation, low and limited resources. On demographic sphere, the proportion of households on land size has changed dramatically little since 2000 to 2001. According to national demographic survey, two percent of the households who live on agriculture do not own land for cultivation, this means that they rent, sharecrops or borrow land (EICV, 2018).

Around half of cultivating household cultivate less than a hectare, and more that 60% of household cultivate less than 0.7 hectare of land and more than a quarter cultivate less than 0.2 hectare (EICV, 2018). This means that there is a lack of land for cultivation while big number of people in Rwanda live in agriculture.

In Rwandan community, the standard of living is strongly related to the land holding. The people who have big land are considered to be rich while those with leased land are considered to be poorest. In Rwanda, the land holding and household sizes are major causes of poverty increase. Due to the obscure situation that affect the community left the country with many households headed by female. Many households in Rwanda are said to be female headed household while the female household are more likely to be poor than those headed by men. Ill health is highly significant in Rwanda as most of the households do not access clean water easily, the lack of safe water and sanitation, limited utilization of health services and unqualified infrastructures (UNRISD, 2017).

According to Harvey (1957) and Richard (1956), the developing countries have fallen behind the developed countries because of their high population growth. This was done in analyzing the Malthusian theory of population trap, showing how people increase leads to limited resources, scarcity of land and lack of food for consummation, which lead to extreme poverty and hunger. As it is in Rwanda, the family in many family members is likely to remain I vicious circle of poverty due to many people dependence to one person. To fight against these factors of poverty, Rwanda emphasized on different development policies such as homegrown solution and grassroots centered generation of intellectual and material resources, utilized with the aim of ensuring a local population to be more familiar to the government policies and programs.

This is to increase the participation of indigenous knowledge but also consideration of cultural and social phenomenon. According the government of Rwanda, indigenous knowledge base social policies are cost effective and able to affect more easily grassroots development due to the fact that people are familiar to their problems and have their own ways of resolution and innovation rather than focusing on external factors. The government of Rwanda has achieved to sustainable development and poverty reduction over last 10 years though it is considered as the poor country in the world. Nevertheless, according to National Institute of Statistics, the total of 45% of the population remains in poverty line, while a quarter of the population live in extreme poverty or below poverty line, whereby they are unable to access to necessities of life (NISR, 2012). The households that live in extreme poverty are unable access to their basic needs or mitigate the effects of the risks

or cope with any problematic issue in case they occur. However, there are different people in poverty line in Rwanda; there are different policies and programs that projected to poverty reduction.

2.5. Graduation program

The Graduation approach is an integrated supports intended to assist a pathway out of extreme and chronic poverty (Concern Worldwide, 2020). The graduation program is the process in which a given supports are provided to poor vulnerable community in order to help them get or have access to basic needs and lift themselves from extreme poverty. The Programs consist of a number of core components that together either support an individual to engage in sustainable economic activities, through self- or waged employment. Essential to this is an understanding of the market system, the roles than men and women play and any barriers to access and participation. Also essential is the timing and sequencing of support which can influence a person's graduation trajectory.

Graduation program was implemented by the advice-giving group as the way of supporting extreme poor after being implemented by BRAC, which is the partner of more than 34 countries around the world. Graduation program is considered as cash advantageous program and skills transfers with other service components such as sensitization, psychological supports (Roelen et al, 2017). The graduation program promotes and social protection programs that provide supports to the deprived people and helps in improving and providing positive wellbeing and remove all obstacles to social inclusion (Roelen, 2014; Samson, 2015). The poorest people to be supported are selected within the community based participatory processes (Hargreaves et al, 2007).

The term graduate is commonly associated with the successful completion of degree, course or training though it may also used as the move from down to upwards; the changes from bad to good condition of life. It is the latter that we mean when using the term graduation; referring to the steady change of individuals and households from extreme poverty to food security and sustainable livelihoods. According to Eldhar Shafir (2012), "Scarcity leads you to borrow in ways that are not insightful. The same person would do much better if they had just been a little less poor." This means that, once the people's consumption needs have been stated and the gap to get them, then the graduation approach is ready to provide supports through money saving, training, coaching and encouragement. One of the goal of graduation approach is protection approach, though it is different from what is empirical because it is commonly known that the extreme poor people around the world

live in the countries that do not have social protection to their citizens or opportunity for formal employment (Ricardo Sabates, 2014).

According to Hashemi & Montesquiou, (2011), there are four services provided by graduation program. These services includes, first the beneficiaries are given a support of something to consume such as food to meet households' direct needs; the second is that after being offered the immediate support, the households are offered the savings which encourages the beneficiaries to have the culture of saving through mobilization on individual accounts, opening accounts for participants at post office, while the third service is provision of training and regular life skills coaching throughout the program. this is done weekly visit of households by program staffs. The final component in a graduation approach program is asset transfers to launch a livelihood activity (Hashemi & de Montesquiou, 2011).

The graduation program is known by different development institutions, stakeholders and governments because it means success in reducing poverty (Ricardo Sabates, 2014).

2.5.1. Key activities of the Graduation Program

These are activities done in a given community to help the disadvantaged people until their graduation so that they can be resilient on their own instead of waiting other people or supports from outside. Such activities includes:

Strengthening community-based support approaches to increase income generating activities and support for poor and vulnerable peoples in the informal economy and through social protection schemes. There is also the provision of trainings to community and local government leaders on how to implement the social protection structures that are designed to focus on improving the productive capacity of vulnerable and resource poor households. Graduation program also provides skills development and resource transfers to develop productive assets with an emphasis on entrepreneurship, marketing and income generation activities, savings promotion activities and asset transfers.

The apportionment of households to Ubudehe category is done in village whereby all community members are allowed to participate in such activity. All households are allocated to one of 5 or 6 wealth categories, from the poorest to the richest, this is done to know whether a given household is allowed to be beneficiaries of graduation or to know how the graduation program promote people's

lives. Those in the category one and two are taken as members of their communities to be extremely poor and vulnerable. These people of category of one and two are the ones who are selected as the beneficiaries of graduation program where they are helped until they graduate to other category. According to FinScope (2012), 5 percent of households in Rwanda are in the bottom category and 26 percent are in the second poorest category.

Selecting the households of graduation program is done in the participation of all community members in order to avoid nepotism or any other unfair selection. The graduation program first considers the households that are classified on the category one and two of ubudehe. And then, all community members of each village, divided in three groups of women, men and opinion leaders, were asked to identify the poorest households amongst them and the lists they drew up were then discussed and agreed by all adult members of the communities. A committee comprising of Local Cell Authority, Concern and partner staff validated the list to ensure that the poorest and most vulnerable households that meet the program selection criteria (Ricardo Sabates, 2014).

Table 1: Graduation Criteria and Graduation Indicators

Pillar	Graduation Criteria	Sample Indicators
Social Protection	<p>Family members are healthy and food secure.</p> <p>The household has access to basic services (health, safety nets, and safe water).</p> <p>Household income meets basic needs.</p>	<p>All household members have at least two nutritious meals per day in the past week.</p> <p>Children at risk of malnutrition show a healthy rate of weight increase for their age.</p> <p>Household income meets basic needs.</p>
Livelihood Promotion	<p>Increased asset accumulation and continuous engagement in profitable and diverse livelihoods.</p> <p>Multiple sources of income that exceed regular household expenditures.</p>	<p>Value of productive assets has doubled since the initial transfer.</p> <p>The household has access to at least two productive assets and to markets.</p>

<p>Financial Inclusion</p>	<p>Household savings increase significantly.</p> <p>The household regularly participates in a local savings scheme.</p> <p>The household has access to credit.</p>	<p>Household savings are above a certain threshold (determined by context and profile of the target group).</p> <p>Savings can cover at least the lean periods, a major crisis, or household event.</p> <p>The household is linked to formal savings and microcredit institutions.</p>
<p>Social Empowerment</p>	<p>Household members are part of and participate in community activities, groups, and organizations.</p> <p>Children are educated.</p> <p>Family members, including the children, have a positive mindset and hope for the future.</p> <p>Women and girls have a voice and decision-making rights equal to male members of the household.</p>	<p>Household members participate in community activities or social groups.</p> <p>Male family members assist with household chores.</p> <p>All children are on track to complete primary and secondary education.</p> <p>Both boys and girls receive equal treatment and opportunities.</p> <p>All children feel safe, loved, and aspire to a better future.</p> <p>Household members have a clear vision for the future.</p> <p>Women are able to control their own assets.</p> <p>Men and women in the household share financial management.</p> <p>Women's knowledge, skills, confidence, and leadership have increased.</p> <p>Women of reproductive age are using family planning (if applicable).</p>

Source: Concern Worldwide (2011)

2.5.2. Gender inequality and the Graduation approach

Rigid gender norms frequently dictate that men dominate intra-household decision-making and take responsibility for the principal income generation, while the division of household labor and childcare responsibilities fall disproportionately to women, reducing their capacity to play a productive role within the family. Gender based violence (GBV) is often used to reinforce men's power and dominance and the gendered expectations they try to fulfill, and can be exacerbated by poverty. GBV causes a myriad of detrimental effects on women, men and entire families that persist from generation to generation, including psychological, physical and economic (Graduation Program Concern Worldwide, 2020). Concern Worldwide understands extreme poverty as the deprivation of basic resources and low profit on those resources, underpinned by inequality, and risk and vulnerability to hazards. Graduation programs aim to increase asset levels and improve returns on these assets whilst also addressing the many interlinked causes, obstacles and all factors that hinder people lifting themselves from extreme poverty (Graduation Program Concern Worldwide, 2020).

All of the gender inequalities mentioned, from power dynamics to gender roles to GBV, are learned behaviors. With culturally sensitive gender transformative approaches, they can also be unlearned, thus removing some of the key barriers to men and women escaping extreme poverty. Given the critical links between the aim of the Graduation approach and gender outlined above, it is critical that Concern's Graduation programs apply a gender lens at every stage and take a gender transformative approach to tackle entrenched gender norms. This means that it is needed to understand the existing gender roles and power dynamics in the communities it is working in to identify how they affect attitudes, practices and behaviors that affect household capacity to sustainably emerge from extreme poverty. For example, identify who makes which decisions, who has access to, and capacity for, which income generating activities; Identify the different needs, challenges and preferences of women and girls, including their autonomy, decision-making power, control of income or household assets, violence, cultural norms and practices, vocational and training preferences (Concern Worldwide 2020). Make sure not to reinforce negative or harmful stereotypes ('exploitative' on the Gender Continuum).

This could mean, for example, that we do not *only* offer women the opportunity to build their skills in income- generating activities which are traditionally done by women, as these are likely to generate significantly less income than those selected for men. Instead, it can aim to widen the scope of opportunity; Design programs that address the root causes of the issues that affect poverty outcomes,

such as unequal division of labor, voice and decision-making power by transforming gender attitudes and norms ('transformative' on the Gender Continuum), and then, Regularly monitor program activities throughout implementation to avoid creating unintended negative consequences

2.6. Overview of Concern Worldwide Rwanda

Rwanda attained to sustainable economic growth and poverty reduction for long period, and most of its population have been lifted from extreme poverty to poverty. The government has implemented different programs and policies to increase living condition of the poor people who were trapped on extreme poverty and those who are unable to lift themselves from poverty. Concern worldwide Rwandan is one of the programs that have contributed a lot to the economic growth of the community (Ricardo Sabates and Stephen Devereux, 2014). The concern worldwide in support with the government of Rwanda to achieve sustainable development and poverty reduction, in 2011 concern worldwide has launched enhancing the productive capacity of extremely poor people which is called the 'graduation program' in other words; and this was conducted in two district of Rwanda, in southern province. The program focused mostly on the households that would be normally be eligible for direct supports of VUP and VUP is able to approve why those people should be supported by concern worldwide, while they were given all supports from the VUP including cash transfers while there are others that should be helped instead (de Montesquiou *et al.* 2014).

Concern worldwide is the program that help improve the living conditions of poor people in developing countries including Rwanda focusing mostly on graduation of participants out of extreme poverty, through the provision of integrated and intensive package of support in a given period which is often two or three years (Concern Worldwide Rwanda, n.d.). Concern Worldwide understands extreme poverty to be a lack of basic needs and low production or income from their deeds, underpinned by inequality, and risk and vulnerability to hazards. Graduation programs aim to increase asset levels and improve returns on these assets whilst also addressing the many interlinked different factors or obstacles that hinder the development of the people. Concern first adopted a Graduation approach¹ to livelihood development in Haiti in 2008. Since then, it has implemented Graduation programs in eight countries (Bangladesh, Burundi, Democratic Republic of Congo, Ethiopia, Haiti, Malawi, Rwanda and Zambia) and reached over 25,000 households and 115,000 direct recipients. Increasingly, Concern's Graduation programs are including gender transformative approaches at their core. This brief presents the core components of the Graduation approach,

explains the meaning of gender transformative programming, and provides examples from Rwanda, Malawi and Bangladesh, which include specific program approaches to address gender inequality at the household level (Concern Worldwide, 2020).

The concern worldwide has implemented the graduation program in southern province of Rwanda, with some research components to show the impacts of the graduation to the community through social protection. The graduation program was designed to help the disadvantaged people from poverty through cash transfers, skills development to help them improve their livelihood by their own, and train them how to save for future protection and increase their resilience to any unpredicted crisis (Ricardo Sabates & Stephen Devereux, 2014). The program is interlinked with VUP as their prime purpose is to improve the living condition of disadvantaged people from poverty to graduation. This objectives and supports of both interventions have proved great impact to the community and improved the living condition of poor people.

The program expect to support its beneficiaries to the level that they can from dependence to external supports stage and reach to the level whereby they can rely on their own effort, which means to the level of self-resilient, where they no longer need such support and can leave the program (Concern Worldwide, 2014). Concern Worldwide works to address extreme poverty and has implemented programs using this model of graduation in Burundi, Rwanda and Haiti. These programs are not projected to lift households' members to a given level of self-resilient or remove people from other social assistance but also to show some root causes, hindrances of people from extreme poverty. For instance in Rwanda, this programs work in collaboration with local government to engage both men and women in order to ensure gender equality in the implementation of the programs.

2.6.1. Concern worldwide graduation program in Rwanda

Concern worldwide graduation program provide to the poor people both cash transfers and productive assets transfers, microfinance, provision of trainings on income generating activities, coaching in life skills, and strengthening the community support mechanisms (de Montesquiou et al., 2014). Concern understands the poverty as the lack of access to basic needs with two major drivers, which are inequality and risks and vulnerability.

Concern's Graduation Model 3 is a multi-pronged approach intended to address these three dimensions. The concern's graduation program is generally be explained by theory of change, targeting extremely poor households and providing a inclusive supports including income and asset/capital transfers; facilitating access to basic services including financial services and bringing training and mentorship, beneficiaries and providing various livelihoods ways, and increase the resilience to lifecycle shocks and stresses (Concern Worldwide 2017).

Concern Worldwide has adopted the graduation program by combining several social protection and livelihood promotion aspects, which are cash transfers to meet basic needs; sensitization and reinforcement of savings promotion activities for risk mitigation and potential investment in productive activities. Skills development and the provision of resources to enable the development of productive income generating activities; reinforce community-based support mechanisms to enhance non-farm employment, and capacity development to graduate into access to credit (www.cgap.org/graduation accessed on December 2020).

The main activities of the graduation program are promoting the community- based supports mechanisms in order to improve their income generating opportunities and help poor people in inform economy through social protection schemes. The program also provided trainings for local leaders on how to implement the process of selection up to graduation even after; there is also skills development and resource transfers to develop the productive capacity of poor people through the entrepreneurship, which is the most important component of graduation program, as well as marketing and income generating activities, savings promotion activities and asset transfers (activities (Concern Worldwide Rwanda 2014).

These activities are implemented following their steps starting from the consumption supports in order to make households more sufficient, followed by savings, skills training and at last asset

transfer. The graduation program at first stage targeted 1200 extreme poor people in two sections whereby the first section selected 400 and 800 on the second section. On this section the supports provided on first section were different from those to be provided on the second section. The first section received cash transfer for eighteen months while the second section received cash for twelve months (Sabates, R., Devereux & Abbott, 2013). The average of amount of cash transfer provided to every beneficiary was 18000 Rwandan francs per month, and this was planned refer to the number of households members.

Concern applied the graduation program in the Southern Province of Rwanda since 2011. Under the first phase of the program (2011-2106) Concern reached 2,600 households (approximately 12,740 direct recipients) across three Districts (Huye, Nyaruguru and Gisagara) whilst, under the current phase of the program (2017-2021) Concern is reaching 2,000 households (approximately 9,600 direct recipients) in Gisagara District. The first phase showed that outcomes could have been enhanced by including a component that directly addressed restrictive gender norms, accordingly, in the current phase of the program (Concern Worldwide, 2015).

2.6.2. The five essential components of Concern's Graduation Model

These are essential components of graduation model that help the graduation program to be more successful and improve the living conditions of extreme poor people to the self-resilient stage.

- **Comprehensive targeting**

The comprehensive targeting makes sure that extreme poor people are identified as program participants and that their selection have been done in fair and following the criteria provided by the program.

- **Consumption or income support**

The consumption or income support provided in the form of a regular cash transfer to help participants meet their basic needs while they engage in expanding and diversifying livelihood strategies. The program also makes sure that the support provided have reached to the beneficiaries in a good and productive ways

- **Provision of skills and regular coaching**

The program provides skills trainings as well as regular coaching focusing on human capital and include provision of access to practical, short trainings as well as routine coaching and mentoring visits.

- **Facilitating access to savings facilities**

Facilitating access to savings facilities and where feasible credit; in order to increase employment and entrepreneurship within the community, which decrease dependence and improve economic development of the community.

- **An asset transfer**

The program provide the asset transfer to startup economic activity; supporting participants to establish themselves in a small business or to seek employment that is more formal. This also helped the vulnerable people feel more confident as they start deciding on their own about their productive activities that can help them from extreme poverty

2.6.3. Improving the productive capacity of extremely poor households through Concern Worldwide Rwanda

The concern worldwide graduation program has been implementing the improving the industrious capacity of extreme poor people in southern province since 2011, in two districts which are Huye and Nyaruguru district, though it has added other more two districts which are Nyamagabe and Gisagara districts in order to expand it works and improve the living conditions of poor people from different parts of the country. Nowadays, the program reaches higher 11, 000 direct beneficiaries in 2,600 households over the four districts (Concern Worldwide, 2015).

In order to be qualified as the ,member beneficiaries of concern worldwide graduation program, the household must be in the category one and two of Ubudehe where there allocated the poor and most disadvantaged people. The other criteria include that the household must have at least one member who is able to work; the household must be landless at least less than 0,25 acres or homeless; the must also have no cattle or less than three goats; the must possess no income generating activities; not high school or technical qualifications and are not supported by any other programs. After being qualified and registered as the member of concern graduation program, the beneficiaries receive an average of 18000 Rwandan Francs, that provided depending on the number of households members, each month and this are done in 18 months to support their basic needs and provide them with the

opportunity to concentrate on developing sustainable income generating activities. The consumption and income support was originally planned for 12 months but was extended for a further six months as the majority of participants were using income for house construction ‘over half were homeless at the start of the program’ as encouraged through the government villagization program (Jenny Swatton, 2016).

The beneficiaries of concern graduation are provided the support of assets transfer in the form of cash or money of 65000 Rwandan francs in two installments to help them income generating activities which focused on establishment of small business such as trade of animals; setting up kiosks and small shops or providing other services that generate income like cycles, moto circle or any other related developmental activities. This first asset transfer was set after six months of the end of income support phase and upon the completion of enterprise development training, and the second one was implemented in six months later (Concern Worldwide, 2015).

This program was established to support the government in the implementation of national social protection strategy especially in the line of vision 202 umurenge program (VUP), because the prime objective of both is to help the extreme poor people or disadvantaged to escape from poverty. The concern graduation objective is to improve and reinforce the productive capacity of the poor people who are able to work and increase their resilience through the provision of support not only to meet their basic needs but also set out problems and challenged that hinder improvement of those poor people (Ricardo Sabates, 2014). This was made by the program to ensure the self-confidence of the poor people and enable them to plan for future production

2.6.4. Making Graduation Programs/Concern worldwide a Gender Transformative in Rwanda

A key approach used in gender transformative Graduation programs is gender transformative dialogue with male and female program participants.

Before implementing gender transformative dialogue, it is critical that staff have participated themselves in the training content that they will deliver to communities, and that they believe in the content of this material and the concepts behind it. Concern’s global partnership with Sonke Gender Justice has been one way to work towards this through the delivery of gender transformative workshops to Concern and partner staff and to support them to challenge their own beliefs and attitudes. Following this, a training of trainers on the specific curriculum is essential. Some countries

also hold regular reflective conversations among staff on various gender issues to support staff transformation. Monitoring, coaching and support to those facilitating are key to ensuring quality.

Concern works in partnership with the National Women's Council (NWC) and National Youth Council (NYC) at District and Sector levels who were trained to deliver the 'Men Engage' gender component of the training. Weekly sessions are held with Graduation participants living in couples for a period of three months, covering power, decision-making, asset management, family planning, and positive relationships and encourage proper utilization of program inputs. Concern staff regularly monitor these sessions. The initial impact evaluation of the program, undertaken by the Institute of Development Studies in 2015, found that the program had very positive impacts on a wide range of indicators. These included productive and domestic assets, living conditions, food security, and sanitation and health practices - 12, 36 and 48 months after joining the program (relative to baseline and compared to a control group) (Devereux, S. & Sabates, R. 2015).

The study conducted by Devereux and Isimbi (2019) showed an improvement in women's decision making ability in the home, improved communication and reduced conflict between couples, increased involvement of men in household chores and childcare and couples being seen as role models to others in the community. In addition, positive program impacts were found in individual empowerment, especially for women. At the personal level, most participants increased their sense of self-confidence and control over their life. In terms of economic empowerment, access to cash and assets, the ability to make purchases and access to income-earning opportunities all improved.

2.6.4. summary of the literature

This chapter went through different studies related to the graduation program and how they contribute to the development of people beneficiaries. This chapter showed different policies and programs related to human development and how these programs are applied for the sake of people's development and poverty reduction. The section also showed different theories of development and poverty reduction and how they contribute to graduation programs and how they help in implementation of these programs effectively and efficiently. There have been conducted many researcher and studies concerned to graduation programs in many countries though most of them were reported according to the country or level of applicability of the programs which are different from country to country, and which can be error to consider that without conducting our own research to compare the results.

CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1. Introduction

Chapter three described how this research was conducted. It is composed of study design, study approach, study area, study population and sampling techniques, Data collection tools and how data were processed and analyzed. The study was carried out on the concern worldwide beneficiaries and the local leaders in Muganza sector, Gisagara district in order to get the information.

3.2. Study design

In this research, researcher used qualitative approach in the study because it was social occurrence where she dealt with life experiences of Concern's beneficiaries in Muganza sector as one of graduation programs, how their living conditions were changes/improved because of support got from the concern worldwide. The study was conducted on the concern worldwide beneficiaries in Muganza sector to see how it has contributed to their economic growth. In the design the qualitative approach was used in order to effectively deal with social traits and help in solving social problems. These approaches were used by researcher, because this is social sciences that deals with the feelings and emotion and people's views during data collection. The researcher has chosen concern worldwide as the case study by focusing on all people who live in Muganza sector especially those who are supported by concern worldwide.

3.3. Administrative Units of the study area

The republic of Rwanda has been divided in provinces, districts, sectors, cells and villages, while the district is considered as the basic unity of political administrative unity of the country. The village is the smallest unity of political administrative unity of the country which is very close to the citizens. The leaders in this level are volunteers who work without and rewards and they are elected without universal suffrage. The next is cell, which is executed by competent technicians with other political teams members to serve as decision makers and advisors to those technicians. The key organizational body of the cell is the cell council (CC), which is composed of all citizens, which have 18, and above

years old. The cell council elects the Cell Executive Committee with ten members for better implementation.

Then there is sector as the third level of administrative where people select their representatives from the cell and villages to represent them. Gisagara district is composed of thirteen sectors, which are Gikonko, Gishubi, Kansi, Kibilizi, Kigembe, Mamba, Muganza, Mugombwa, Mukindo, Musha, Ndora, Nyanza, and Save sectors. The sector has the political organ called sector council that was established for policy-making. The number of sector council members is equal with the cells that compose sector. The sector council elects the sector executive committee (SEC) to support the preparation and implementation of its policies, plans and decisions. This unity is composed of ten members and monitors the day to day administration of the sector and works with the technical support of its two sub committees which are political and administrative committee (PAC) and the community development committee (CDC) (NISR, 2012).

Muganza sector is one of 13 sectors composed Gisagara district and it is one of the sector where concern worldwide is working in. Muganza sector has five cells, which are Cyumba, Remera, Muganza, Saga and Rwamiko cells and the project is implemented in all these cells that compose Muganza sector.

3.4. Study area and study population

The study was conducted in Muganza sector, Gisagara district, and southern province. Gisagara district is one of the eight districts that compose southern province of Rwanda, and it is the fourth poor district of the country (Statoids, 2014). The district has the surface of 679 km² with thirteen sectors and 59 cells with a total of 518 villages. The district has 322, 506 inhabitants with the average of 475 inhabitants per square kilometer (NISR, 2012).

The target population of this study is the concern worldwide beneficiaries from Muganza sector, in Gisagara district whereby the graduation program as the one of approach of concern worldwide has had the big impacts on the livelihood of the citizens. In this study researcher took people beneficiaries of concern worldwide in Gisagara District, Muganza sector. Among those populations are people beneficiaries of concern worldwide who are supported in all supports given by the organization, the leaders of Muganza sector as well as the concern worldwide leaders in the sector. All these categories of respondents conducted and information provided by them was so important to make the study

accomplished. Muganza sector was taken as the case study and concern worldwide members as the population of the study. This was the sector where the concern worldwide has been occurred and has many beneficiaries than the rest three ones. The sector is, Muganza, this sector provided the picture of concern worldwide in the whole three sectors which are Mugombwa, Muganza and Gishubi because it is the sector that has many concern worldwide beneficiaries who are active and graduated compared to the rest sectors.

Table 2: That illustrates target population

Category of target population	Frequency target population
Sector staff	11
Cell staff	10
Chief of villages	20
Concern staff	18
Concern Worldwide beneficiaries	500
Total	559

Primary data (2021)

3.5. Sample size and sample techniques

The study used purposive sampling in the data collection process in order to get the accurate information that lead to the success of study. The integrated graduation program leaders provided the list of graduated beneficiaries in Muganza sector and the researcher took the respondents depending on the criteria stated for them to participate. The supports given include cash transfers, assets transfers, skills trainings and shelter for homeless. The research used purposive sampling to collect the data from the concern worldwide beneficiaries and local leaders in order to select people who are able to give updated and accurate information to avoid bias or any other duplications. The sample size of this study was composed of 45 participants whereby some were concern worldwide beneficiaries from Muganza sector, local leaders from the sector and Concern Worldwide leaders. This sample size of the population has delivered the precise information that helped the researcher to get to the success of the study.

Table 3: That illustrates the sample size of the population of the study.

Category of sample size of population	Frequency target population
Sector staff	2
Cell staff	2
Community leaders	4
Concern staff	2
The beneficiaries of the Concern Worldwide	35
Total	45

Primary data (2021)

3.6. Source of data .

The researchers used primary data which is data drawn from respondents immediately face-to-face. Such information was taken from concern worldwide beneficiaries and local leaders whom researcher consulted. The secondary data also were used whereby the researcher read books, reports and papers about graduation program in Rwanda and its roles in poverty eradication. The secondary data used in this study are the information from the Concern Worldwide Rwanda, to know how the beneficiaries are selected, supports given, the implementation of the program and the impacts it had to the community from the time it had been set in the sector.

3.7. Data collection tools

These are instruments used by researcher to gather information from different respondents. This method was used to get information that fit her research with the update information. Among the tools used in this research, include questionnaire, interview, focus group discussions and documentation.

3.7.1. Documentation

The documentary review provides the researcher with documents related to the topic under study which requires the researcher to sit and read, understands and analyze to the level she got sufficient information. During the process of documentary analysis, researcher read documents and after understanding and analyzing the relevance of the texts, she sorted them on manuscripts and later typed then on a computer for compilation. Among the documents read by researcher includes reports, newspapers, government records about concern worldwide graduation program and other related publications.

3.7.2. The questionnaire

The questionnaire was constructed refers to the questions and objectives of the study, while the questions are designed in relations to the objectives of the study. She designs the questions for Integrated graduation program as one of the strategies of Rwanda to eradicate extreme poverty in Rwanda; the questions on how to put in practice the Integrated graduation program activities in Muganza sector and the profits of beneficiaries drawn from the graduation program as well as the challenges they meet during the implementation. The researcher used the questionnaires form to the people in charge of graduation program particularly concern worldwide leaders at the sector level and local leaders were she selected 2 sector staff, 2 cell staff and 4 community leaders ‘ respondents in Muganza sector. Every respondent was given the questionnaires to fill in and submit the completed form to the researcher.

The researcher used unstructured “open ended” questions in the questionnaire, as it is one of the tools that give qualitative orientation. In questionnaire respondents were given free time to respond all the questions asked in order to state all their opinions. The researcher also used “close ended” questions, which gives respondents variety of choices to select among them. The researcher used two types of questions, one for concern worldwide beneficiaries during the interview and others to grassroots

leaders. The researcher designed questions with overwhelming ideas that persuade respondents to be open to the researcher and that help reach the conclusion. This was used to analyze the feelings, views and expression during speaking of respondents. The study was conducted in English but because the data were collected on people from Muganza sector, whereby most of them do not know English, in order to help them understand the questions and reply correctly, the questionnaire were translated in Kinyarwanda language, which helped in accessing to good and accurate information.

3.7.3. Interview

The interview also was used to get the direct information from respondents through face-to- face interview with one household headed. The interview was conducted under pre-determined questions Guide and took place at the respondent's house. The interview was conducted until there is no new idea from the respondents.

This is one of the most used tools on data collection by most of the researchers because it provide real information from the respondents directly. The researcher used semi-structured interview by asking written questions and asked unwritten following the conversation being held between them. The researcher also used unstructured interview by asking respondents unwritten questions but conducting the respondents to the problems related to the research understudy.

3.7.4. Focus group discussions

The researcher used this tool after collecting information from interview and questionnaire in order to find out if the information provided using those techniques are for real. She grouped the Integrated graduation program beneficiaries representative from each cell into 2 groups of 8 participants each group. One focus group discussion held at Remera cell another at Muganza cell. The respondents were given some topics to discuss and through discussions and experience sharing; The researcher had more understand how the Integrated graduation program has contributed to the improving of the living conditions of its beneficiaries in Muganza sector.

3.8. The process of data collection

In the process of processing data collected, the researcher used editing where she edited information collected to avoid errors. Refers to the objectives of this study, which was to found out the role the Integrated Graduation Program in reduction of extreme poverty in Gisagara District. The study used the interview and documentation, which was analyzed and accessed to the level that provide accurate information. There was also the use of questionnaire and interview on the second and third objectives,

which are to analyze the impact of Integrated Graduation Program in economic development of community in Muganza sector and to find out how Integrated Graduation Program increased the livelihood of people in Muganza sector. On the interview guide, the researcher used face-to-face interview and both semi-structured and unstructured interview were used to give in deep time to the respondents to give accessible information. The editing was done cautiously and attentively in order to avoid repetition of some answers or any other errors that can hinder to advancement of research. The coding also where used through the percentages. The similar responses were grouped according to their different categories. On the questionnaire consisted of questions regarding to demographic characteristics of respondents such as ages, gender, educational level and Ubudehe category of respondents and their economic status. After these demographic information, on the questionnaire, there was questions related to integrated graduation program and the wellbeing of the people especially focusing concern worldwide beneficiaries.

3.9. Data Analysis and Reporting

The qualitative data analysis is the technique that use emotion, feelings and explanation of words or information form someone. The data were analyzed in order to understand the rationale of the respondents through structured questions related to the research. In analyzing the data, researcher used qualitative approach to get information about topic. The qualitative data are the data that are non-numerical and usually descriptive or nominal in nature. This means that the data collected are in the form of words and sentences. Sometimes such data seizures the feelings, emotions or subjective perceptions of something. Qualitative approach aims to address the ‘how’ and the ‘why’ of a program and tend to use unstructured methods of data collection to fully explore the topic. The respondents were asked questions related to concern worldwide directly in order to see their reaction, expression in responding in order to get good information from them either through signs, expressions or sound.

3.8. Ethical consideration

The study project, after being completed were submitted to the University of Rwanda, Huye campus and for ethic committee to approve it. The ethics to consider in this research ensuring of respondents about confidentiality of information their provided, asking them to participate voluntarily, then after the participants’ decision to participate, and then they were assured the security of information provided and the privacy of their personal information. The researcher consulted the department leader where the research took place in order to be approved to conduct the research there before

being conducted. The above steps were followed in order to obtain the participants' consent. All information was recorded into the data collection form by using code rather than name of participants for proper data analysis and anonymous.

3.8. Summary of the chapter

This chapter of research methodology explained different methods and methodology used by researcher in data collection. The section showed research approaches and instruments used to gather information and how that information were processed and analyzed. The study also detailed data collection tools such as interview, questionnaire, and documentation; the ethics researcher used and people visited for data collection.

CHAPTER FOUR

DATA THE PRESENTATION

4.1. Introduction

This section is mainly present, interpret and analyze the findings of the study. It concerned with the discussions of the study's exploratory findings from respondents. The analysis of the data is based on primary data obtained from direct respondents. The primary data also was used and collected from Muganza sector, Gisagara district whereby the graduation program is operating. The secondary data were also used to know the historical information on the graduation program and its role in poverty reduction of its beneficiaries.

4.2. The characteristics of respondents

The general data that was needed to make the study so clear and relevant was the ages, gender, marital status, and the occupations in which respondents have within the institution. The ages of respondents can help understand the economic status of the community and the experience they have to the position; gender is the factor for women empowerment and taking part in economic and social development of community. Marital status is state at which people are attributed or acquired as they grow which are in four categories such as married; single, divorced and widowed. All these categories affect people's marital status increase the understanding of the gender. This helps the researcher to interpret the findings found in her study and helped the readers and all those who use this study to easily understand what researcher found in the areas of study.

Table 4: The demographic characteristics of respondents

	Characteristics of respondents	Frequency	Percentage
Gender	Female	22	49
	Male	23	51
	Total	43	100
Ages group	18-28	6	14
	29-38	14	31
	39-48	15	33
	49 above	10	22

	Total	43	100
Marital status	Single	3	7
	Married	20	45
	Separated	9	20
	Divorced	0	0
	Widowed	11	24
	Single mother	2	4
	Single father	0	0
	Total	45	100
Educational level	No education	18	40
	Primary	20	45
	TVET	1	2
	Secondary	2	4
	University	4	9
	Total	45	100
	Employment status	No occupation	0
Farmers		31	70
Livestock		6	13
Leader in concern worldwide		2	4
Local leaders		6	13
Total		45	100
Ubudehe categorization		Category 1	25
	Category 2	12	27
	Category 3	8	8
	Category 4	0	
	Total	45	100

Sources: primary data, 2021

The age of respondents helps the researcher know which questions to ask who for better responses. The researcher decided to use all the categories of years to understand. The ages help the researcher to know the questions to ask every respondent in order to get the accurate information from them. Here each category has been asked the questions that could

influence and attract the respondents to give the information. On the ages of respondents it is illustrated that 14% respondents have between 18 and 28 ages, 31% have between 29 and 38; 33% of respondents have between 39 and 48 years old while 22% of respondents have between 49 and above years old. This means that the researcher decided to use all categories of respondents from the ages 19 up to the above 49 because in concern worldwide there are all these categories of beneficiaries. The above table illustrated that on gender status 51% of respondents are men and 49% of them are women. This is clear that in the concern worldwide there is supports in both men and women to increase the wellbeing of both of them. The researcher focused on gender equality in order to know how both men and women are supported by concern worldwide.

Refers to the marital status, 7% of total respondents are single; 45% of them are married; 20% of them are separated; 24% of respondents are widowed while 4% of respondents are single mother. Through the above statements, the researcher consulted in all categories of the marital status of the respondents. This is obvious that the concern worldwide has committed to improving the wellbeing of the citizens in Muganza sector, Gisagara district without leaving anyone behind, starting from the disadvantaged people in order to build strong community.

The educational level, it is revealed that that, 40% of respondents have no education; 45% of the respondents have completed their primary; 2% of them have studied the vocational trainings, 4% of the respondents have studied secondary school while only 9% of the respondents who have studied University. This is clear that the researcher has selected in all categories of the respondents within concern worldwide in order to get good and accurate information from them. Among the respondents asked 70% of the respondents are farmers; on 13% of the respondents are livestock; the leaders of concern worldwide-occupied 4% while the local leaders occupy 13% of the respondents. The researcher focused on the respondents' beneficiaries of category one, two and some of the category three in order to get better information about the implementation of concern worldwide in Muganza sector, Gisagara district. The data showed that 55% of the respondents are the beneficiaries of the category one, 27% are the respondents of the category two while 8% of the respondents are from the category three of ubudehe. This means that the concern worldwide have contributed a lot in improving the wellbeing of the citizens especially those in the category one, two and three that are people who are unable to access basic needs within community.

4.3. The statements from respondents about concern worldwide in Muganza sector and their living conditions through the objectives of the research.

4.3.1. The impact of Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda in extreme poverty reduction in Gisagara District.

The integrated graduation program is the program whereby the poor people are given supports and in a given period of time they are replaced by others. As the program targets extreme poor people in Muganza sector, it provides basic needs supports including consumption supports, asset transfer, access to savings, and rigorous training to graduate the poor out of extreme poverty in order to continue use money from the graduation program for better production. As stated by the respondents in Muganza sector, after 18 to 36 months of supports and being provided all kinds of helps, most participants move out of extreme poverty to sustainable livelihoods with food security, stabilized income, increased assets, improved health and self-confidence, however there are some people who go back to extrem poverty due to the use of supports in harsh manner.

Among the five core elements in which program is built on include consumption support, savings, skills training and regular coaching, and an asset transfer. The interdisciplinary approach of the Graduation Program cuts across social protection, livelihood development, and access to finance. The benefits in the lives of the poorest provide strong evidence that the Graduation model can work across time and location. For instance, in Cyumba, Remera and Rwamiko cells in Muganza sector early results indicate a rise in food security and increased asset value/ownership, in particular livestock ownership. The research also in Muganza, and Saga cells in the same sector showed higher food consumption, rise in control over business income and a significant increase in health indicators of the participants' beneficiaries of Concern worldwide in Muganza sector.

The research has found out that the graduation in order to be more effective, need to work in the partnerships with other stakeholders. The graduation here in Muganza sector works with the main stakeholder, which are Concern worldwide as the main source of finance and economic strands though there are others who also play crucial role in the development of social and economic wellbeing. Partnerships are a crucial success factor for the Graduation Program, since few organizations have the capacity to offer all the components of the model effectively on their own. The

pilots are implemented through partnerships with financial service providers, NGOs, and government safety net programs.

The respondent in Saga cell on the group discussions with the researcher joined the Graduation Program in Saga cell. She wanted to build good health family, start a small livestock, and expand her agricultural business. This would allow her to send all two children to school and help treat her husband's stomach tumor. In one year later, she had a vegetable garden through the program, built the small livestock near home, and doubled the initial stock through savings to expand her incomes. Her children are in school, and her husband got the occupation through working together with her and helped him to get bicycle to work for money:

“Now, I can stand on my own two feet and work for my family since I graduated with something that would help me in my future” she added (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Saga cell, 2021).

Through the graduation, many poor people's lives have changed significantly to the level that some of them their ubudehe categorizations have changed willingly as well because their social and economic status have changed. The graduation programs in Rwandan community had different forms though in the research the researcher concerned with concern worldwide Rwanda that had its activities in Muganza sector.

The respondents in the group discussions said, *“The training we got about gender equality have reduced conflict and inequality in our families and improved the economic status of the family because all family members stood up to work together for family development. The concern worldwide taught its members the importance of gender equality through men engage training and the whole community members during community works (imiganda) international awareness day. Nowadays the inequality on Muganza sector's families have changed significantly and the development have prevailed since the establishment of concern worldwide in this sector.”* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Rwamiko cell, 2021).

Because gender discrimination is one of the main causes of family disruption and cause of extreme poverty, concern has focused on fighting against gender discrimination on the families it supports and other near them.

The respondents have proved it in the interview with researcher, *“Concern worldwide has taught and sensitized us to help our family neighbors who live in conflicts about gender equality and their importance in poverty reduction and economic development. so we tried our best and the action are giving good results to the community. This also showed that work together is the main source of economic development.”* (Interview with concern beneficiary in Rwamiko cell, 2021).

Most of extreme poor people are isolated from welfare that is very difficult for them to access to market place because there is nothing to sell or buy in case they have to income generating activities that can help them access to money. Thus, providing supports to these poor people also become very difficult because most of the time they live in remote areas where it is difficult to access due to lack of road, communication networks among others. The top priority for extremely poor people is nearly always to increase household food consumption, access to basic needs and this is what Concern worldwide graduation program aimed to. This prioritization holds great promise for future generations since child malnutrition has many long-term negative consequences, including lower IQ and stunting.

The women respondent in the Interview said, *“The Concern worldwide graduation program is a good program, the program that help the citizens in development. The program help us from poverty, it helps poor people so that you can come from one side (extreme poverty) to other side (resilient)”* (Interview with concern women beneficiaries in Remera cell, 2021).

The development of people encompasses many thing; it means the changes from bad to good situation this means socially, economically and even financially. The other women respondents in the interview with researcher conducted in Saga cell said, *“Concern worldwide is the project that helps poor people from extreme poverty so that she/he can reach the development. The money given as more important to the people because it helps in poverty reduction and the increase of social status of the beneficiaries.”* (Interview with concern beneficiary in Saga cell, 2021).

The financial support through cash transfer provided by concern worldwide in Muganza sector as stated from the respondents, have increased the economic status of the beneficiaries with great improvement to the community. In concern worldwide, we knew new strategies of agriculture, modern agriculture that helped us lift ourselves from poverty and hunger, we were also taught strategic way of protecting IGA. This also helped how we can protect our production and other

money from our properties for better future of family. The concern worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector is meaningful to the wellbeing of the people and it is developmental entity as described by the leader of concern worldwide in the sector,

“Concern Worldwide is a non-governmental, international, humanitarian organization dedicated to the reduction of suffering and working towards the ultimate elimination of extreme poverty in the world's poorest countries. Our mission is to help people living in extreme poverty achieve major improvements in their lives which last and spread without ongoing support from CONCERN. To achieve this we engage in long-term development work, respond to emergency situations, and seek to address the root causes of poverty through our development education and advocacy work.” (Interview with concern Programme Manager, 2021).

From this view of leader respondent in Concern worldwide Rwanda, in Muganza sector, this non-governmental organization is more important to the wellbeing of the people in this sector. It has committed to improving the socio-economic development of the poor people especially those in extreme poverty in order to reduce their bad living conditions.

4.3.2. The impact of Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda in economic development of community in Muganza sector.

The concern worldwide graduation program have good impact on the economic development of the people beneficiaries. The graduation program gives different kinds of supports to more disadvantaged people through the provision of financial supports, trainings on the use of money provided and trainings to encourage them in order to change their mindsets. This is done so that to build in beneficiaries' mentality that though they are given supports but there is a time when that supports will be stopped and they will be asked to provide what they have used those supports given. Economically the money provided during the period before graduation are protected and used in the development programs in order to make them more productive so that during the graduation period, the beneficiaries can show what has been done.

Financially and economically, the concern worldwide graduation program is one of the most powerful tool for poverty reduction and increase of economic development of the people beneficiaries especially in Muganza sector whereby there are many poor people who needed supports from

different sources to be improved from poverty. Among the respondents' views about economic development and how this development achieved.

The respondents stated, *"We were given the supports that resulted in improving our understanding, that we bought the cows; we are giving jobs to others since we used to working for it as well, but after being beneficiaries of concern worldwide, our lives changed completely to the level that everyone see it."* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Saga cell, 2021).

The saving as one of strategic way of economic development is as well on the core of graduation program. there is also the training of poor people after having access on financial institutions to get credits since they have income generating activities to invest in, however savings are in general one of the most important risk-management tools for poor people. In the Graduation Approach, access to savings is one of the earliest steps in the process, coming second only to immediate consumption support in most cases.

"The trainings we were given on gender have decreased the conflicts in our households, improved communications and working together spirit which improved the savings within families. Those trainings also taught us the importance of saving to the future generations and to the sustainable development of the family members. Before we use to work for other in farming activities but nowadays life changed, working in groups helps us to get money for solving our problems. Now we know how to make our own fertilizers in case those from livestock became insufficient." (Interview with concern beneficiaries in Muganza sector, 2021).

The respondents stated that once beneficiaries have access to food and other related basic needs, they are taken to the next stage of starting to save, and play part is informal or formal saving groups in order to plan for future. The concern worldwide program has provided the training to it member beneficiaries, showing them how to save and importance of saving to the community's development. This feature draws on emerging lessons about the importance of savings from the field of *financial inclusion*, and awaken the people beneficiaries their importance to the sustainable development of their families. After being qualified as the member of graduation program, the beneficiaries are provided supports that improve their livelihoods, help start up the better life and cause them be more confident that they can more than what they are experiencing since they have supports. Once the staff

has identified several viable options, the participant chooses from a menu of assets, based on livelihood preferences and experience.

On this state the respondents in Muganza cell said, *“Since I become the beneficiary of concern worldwide, I was given livestock that give me manure that help me in the increase of productivity. This helped me get animals and agricultural production that satisfy my family and access the market for the rest. Without concern worldwide I would have been continued to live in vicious circle of poverty.”* (Interview with concern beneficiaries in Cyumba cell, 2021).

Not only this testimony on the importance of concern worldwide on market access for it beneficiaries but also increase their savings.

The respondents also said, *“The concern is more meaningful to our lives because its deeds have changed our lives. The people beneficiaries who did not have the place to cultivate nowadays have the place for cultivate because they are given money that help in hiring land for cultivation. The children got educational materials for the poor and those who live in others’ houses have got their own houses due to concern worldwide.”* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Rwamiko cell, 2021).

Much have done by concern worldwide in community development and increase of living conditions of it beneficiaries. Different achievements have been achieved since the implementation of Concern Worldwide Rwanda activities in Muganza sector started, as stated by the leader of concern worldwide in Muganza sector,

“Program main achievements are always linked with main outcomes expected from the program interventions among others: improved nutrition, increased income and return on assets, social cohesion, women and marginalized groups inclusion, among others. Primary focus is to tackle what is unique to extreme poverty; a lack of basic assets and/or return on these assets. The graduation approach primarily seeks to build financial, human and physical capital, three of the four basic assets. It works to ensure that while beneficiaries slowly build up an asset base, they develop the skills to be able to maximize the potential of their assets, emphasizing the enhancement of gender equality and equality of outcome, seeking ways to address the specific obstacles that marginalized individuals or groups face in fully

participating and feeling valued in their community and society.” (Interview with concern leader in Muganza, 2021).

As stated above with the leader, and from the respondents beneficiaries during the interview with researcher, the organization has done and achieved a lot to the wellbeing of beneficiaries and increase of socio-economic development of its beneficiaries to the significant level.

4.3.3. The contribution of Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda to increase the livelihood of people in Muganza sector through different activities.

The research conducted in Muganza sector revealed that food safety and stability is the core and prior for extreme poor household in order to have healthy life. This is because once people don't have healthy life and satisfied food, he cannot even think properly because they affects the level of thinking of family members and lead to having lower IQ, stunting and mineral deficiencies, which is the hinder or obstacle of community development. They are also unable to send their children to school which lead them to live in vicious circle of poverty, illiteracy and hunger, and then as consequence lead to extreme poverty. These are the most and prior causes of people to live without wellbeing because it is impossible for them to get basic needs for their survivor.

The people in Rwamiko cell on the group discussions said, *“The project has taught us how to find out major problems that hinder the development of the people, and then train us process in which those problems can be resolved to the better ways of development. These problems have been in the family but because people were unaware did not know them, after teaching how to view them now we are able to find them and solve it well.”* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Rwamiko cell, 2021).

The people' wellbeing goes hands in hand with social protection program which have a better track record of reaching the extreme poor through a range of interventions from safety nets which are conditional or unconditional cash transfers, food aid, guaranteed employment, for those in immediate need, to social insurance to support those at risk of slipping into destitution. However, safety net programs are typically aimed at immediate relief for basic needs. They include few opportunities for participants to move into economic self-sufficiency. On the wellbeing of the people as stated above the concern worldwide graduation program, provide supports of every means to improve the wellbeing of its beneficiaries and those supports are provided in different ways.

The respondent in Cyumba cell also stated, *“The project has increased our living conditions in different ways, it opened the accounts for us in SACCOs and transferred money for us in 14 months at monthly basis, whereby the family of 1 to 3 members were given 15, 000 Rwandan francs; the family of 4 to 5 members were given 18, 000 Rwandan francs; and those from 6 and over family members were given 21, 000 Rwandan francs. This money came as the source of living conditions and increased our wellbeing of the level that even some of our members have changed even their categories of Ubudehe.”* (Interview with concern beneficiaries in Cyumba cell, 2021).

All the wellbeing strategic ways of concern worldwide was used to leave people with meaningful ways of survivor. This is done in order to improve their living condition and have better life in the future. But few livelihood development programs have addressed the needs of extremely poor households. This is especially the case in rural areas, where livelihood development programs tend to focus on economically active households, typically those with enough land to generate surplus to sell in the market. The project provided in concern worldwide are put in place following the targets and vision of the project members.

The respondents also said, *“The money they give us in the project, sometimes are concerned to the targets and vision of beneficiaries in order to use them considerably. After we were given money eighty-five thousand Rwandan francs (85,000 Rwfs) called IGA money ‘nshore nunguke’ to use in beneficial small businesses. This money has improved our living conditions to the level that is more obvious in savings, business activities and other related developmental activities.”* (interview with concern beneficiaries in Muganza sector, 2021).

The project is the source of community development in every area where it is being established and practiced. From the above statement, with this project more activities are being implemented in different cells of Muganza sector, which even are expanding the surrounding cells. The project did not give the money to the beneficiaries and leave it, but also continued to make follow up so that they can help the people reach their projected target.

This was confirmed by the statement from Saga and Rwamiko cell, where they said, *“after getting money the project did not leave us because at the beginning we were given people at the cell level called ‘abahwituzi b’ingo’ that taught us to see the prior or most challenging problems that the family has; performance contract for every family and different trainings*

like grouping ourselves in small groups of SILC; on the agricultural techniques and business skills trainings; gender equality; family planning and to fight against AIDS/HIV and Hygiene.” (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Rwamiko and Saga cells, 2021).

The respondents also in their discussions with researcher continued saying, *“Those who had nowhere to live the concern worldwide helped them to get shelters by constructing their own houses through the support of cash transfer and Concern give them iron sheets ‘Isakaro’ in order to first give them the place to live.”* This is the activities provided by the concern worldwide to its homeless beneficiaries in order to improve their wellbeing and help play parts in the development of the community.

The livelihood of the family goes beyond economic to human health or social status, the respondent from Cyumba cell in the interview with the researcher said, *“The concern worldwide gave us the training about how to prepare good and nutritious food for our families, which have changed our living conditions completely and increased our level of thinking. Our children’s health is good, they are growing well physically and mentally and even at schools they are succeeding well which give us hope for their better future.”* (Interview with concern beneficiaries in Cyumba cell, 2021).

There are different strategies do you use to eradicate poverty and ensure wellbeing of the people in Muganza sector, these strategies have increased the livelihood of the concern worldwide beneficiaries in Muganza sector and benefited the whole community in general.

The leader in Muganza sector explained, *“To tackle on extremely poverty and its roots causes, Concern Worldwide Rwanda explores a sequence of interventions. Firstly, it targets the extreme poor ordinarily excluded from traditional livelihoods programming for a range of reasons including: extreme poor households lacking basic skills and literacy to participate in some livelihoods programs, and lack of basic needs fulfilment meaning extreme poor people are more occupied with meeting basic needs than livelihoods activities; and socially excluded groups like the historically marginalized people who are overlooked by their community for support.”* (Interview with leader in Muganza sector, 2021).

The leader also continued explaining more about concern worldwide activities to for the wellbeing of its beneficiaries in Muganza sector,

“among the supports given includes, Consumption support within a period of 14 months to meet basic needs; Savings assistance and access financial services to build resilience and access to financial services. Business skills training and regular coaching by dedicated Community Development Animators (CDAs) ‘Coaching and mentoring approach associated with HHs contracts and HHs plan, FFLS (Farmer Field Learning School) as entry point for all programme interventions, Maternal Infant Young Child Nutrition (MIYCN), SILC Groups (Saving and Internal Lending Group) Men Engage training, Supporting DPEM meetings and monthly child growth monitoring and referral. Assets Transfer, which is a financial package up to 85,000 RWF in order to invest and develop own sustainable income generating activity and establishment clusters for beneficiaries sharing similar IGA. Men Engage training & community outreach sessions; Partners coordination meetings and Community Complaints Mechanism.” (Interview with leader in Muganza sector, 2021).

All these mechanisms and strategies provided by concern worldwide have improved the wellbeing of beneficiaries socially and economically to the significant level. The respondents’ beneficiaries also reported that the Graduation Program improved their household food security.

“I could not afford to buy enough food when I started participating in the program. Now, not only do I buy enough food, I also eat what my heart wants like meat, clothes and anything I want.” Importantly, for most this improvement in household food security was sustained post-program. *“At the time I was in Graduation Program I was able to eat at lunch and dinner, me and my family. Even after the Programme we did not lack food, even now we don’t have a problem of hunger.”* She continued saying that in this way, *“I can still afford to buy enough food even today”* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Rwamiko cell, 2021).

4.3.4. The process of selecting concern worldwide beneficiaries in Muganza sector.

The effectiveness and fairness of selecting beneficiaries is one of the main way to the success of this organization. The process of selecting these people beneficiaries is done within community through taking those who are disadvantaged people socially and economically in order to improve their living conditions and lift them from extreme poverty as the main objective of the organization.

The leader in concern worldwide in the interview she explained, *“The program recipients targeting process ensure community participatory approach and local government*

authorities' involvement from outset up to final list of beneficiaries. Our targeting method in graduation programming involve a rigorous process that captures eligible households and minimizes errors by preventing households with greater means from being selected.” (Interview with concern worldwide leader, 2021).

Among the process followed in the selection process of beneficiaries in Muganza sector, include redefining,

program eligibility criteria per program objectives. The identification of program recipients begins with the recall on eligibility criteria as per program objectives; General orientation meeting of Muganza sector Officials (Sector, Cell & Village levels) on beneficiaries targeting process, Local authorities are oriented on targeting process and criteria; Community targeting meetings at village level to establish pre-selected list of beneficiaries and a Pre-selected list validation process up to final list – at four different levels; general community level first, on ground verification by program team (House to house physical verification), then at sector level by village leaders, Cells officials, sector officials, some of beneficiaries representatives and program team, then lastly at general public level for final public view.” (Interview with concern Worldwide leader, 2021).

This process is more crucial to the selection of appropriate beneficiaries who are qualified to be given the supports as stated by the respondents from Saga cell in the group discussions held there,

“The organization's leaders together with the local authorities called for a meeting at the cell level, and separate every village on its side, then in every village their divided 3 groups (group of men, group of women and group of village committee), each group members select the most poor, vulnerable people at the village level. After, the three group come together and do a compilation list starting on those who are voted three times, two times and one vote until the required number of beneficiaries.” (Interview with concern beneficiaries in Saga cell, 2021).

On the other side the woman respondent in the interview with the researcher about the process used and the criteria followed in order to selected the beneficiaries who are needed without discrimination or any other mistakes added,

“Among the criteria used to select the disadvantaged beneficiaries include: people without land, those without livestock means small animals not more than three; without cows or monthly jobs; those without graduated member at university in their family; those who have no other support from any institution; and more importantly if those people respect governmental programs and physically able to work.” (Interview with concern beneficiaries in Remera cell, 2021).

Among these criteria stated above shows this non-governmental organization wishes its beneficiaries to play part in the development of the community not only to the sector level but at national level and this shows how the organization needs more the vulnerable people rather than the those who are able to get the basic needs by themselves. The leader also in the sector during interview with the researcher about the selection process and criteria said, *“We selected those who are in pain than others; who are able to work so that she/he can perform the developmental activities; and those who did not appear in the meetings due to different reasons but who have all criteria as mentioned, were chosen and supported by the organization.”* This means that there was no discrimination during the selection process because the selection period was done within the members of the cell where those people are known in order to avoid nepotisms and corruption.

Some of respondents’ beneficiaries are able to pay for *health insurance* after they graduated from Ubudehe category 1 or 2 to category 3 or above, which means they no longer receive health insurance for free, because they are better off and can afford to pay the annual fees of health insurance.

Here the respondent confirmed it during the group discussions, *“When we were in the program, Concern paid for us through cash transfer. Now, because we have developed and are no longer eligible for health insurance, we pay for ourselves and everyone in the household has a valid health insurance for the year.”* Other respondent in the interview she asserted this, *“Yes, I had health insurance when we were in the program and we have it now. My wife, our baby, my sister and I all have health insurance for this year. I pay for everyone because we are no longer eligible for the subsidized health insurance, as we are in category three.”* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Saga cell, 2021).

The respondent on the other side continued to said,

“Now we have health insurance, we managed to pay on our own because we are in category 2 of Ubudehe, and government pays the insurance for category 1 only.” The respondent

beneficiary also confirmed the importance of concern worldwide in the improvement of social status of its beneficiaries, “The Graduation Program afforded me health insurance for the first year. I now pay for my own health insurance and that of my family members. Now I can afford that.” (Interview with concern beneficiaries in Remera cell, 2021).

4.3.5. The challenges that hinder the development in Muganza sector

Every development has its own hindrances though it can mean nothing since the developer know that so-called hindrance because it can become the strength. Though there are development of beneficiaries of concern worldwide in Muganza sector but the development have not achieved considerably and beneficiaries do not enjoy their development because of different reasons. Among the reasons stated by the respondents includes environment, this means people around them.

These people have jealous for the beneficiaries where they said, “our first challenge we got is the jealous from our neighbors. When we came to get money at concern worldwide, people said many word, teasing us that we came from collecting money ‘tuvuye kuyora’ this jealous caused them to not lend us some tools such as hoes, machete and other related materials saying that we have to buy ours.” The respondents in their discussions with researcher continued saying, *“The other challenges for the people who did not have where to live, the support given did not affect them effectively because the supports given all finished in construction of houses on the provided months and they did not get the chance to get additional supports from the project. While those who had were to live start buying livestock at first step of supports.”* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Rwamiko cell, 2021).

Here the respondents who had the house constructed claimed that even concern has been giving the additional support to those homeless for improving their living conditions economically they could not perform well as those who had their owner house before the program.

The responded in the group discussion also said *“Another challenge for families living in conflict, the support provided by concern before gender equality training has been misused and not significantly impact their living condition.* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries, at Saga cell 2021).

Here the respondents who were in conflict with their partner claimed that gender equality training should be delivered at the beginning of the program. The respondent also said *“Another challenge for beneficiaries who invested in livestock, some animals died due to the diseases”*. Here respondent claimed that Concern should adopt kind of animal insurance because the project closure.

The respondent continued saying, *“although concern has implemented many activities delivering support for lifting extreme poor people to graduation and improved wellbeing conditions; beneficiaries with psychological problems did not achieve graduation because of mental problems.”* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries, in Saga cell 2021).

The respondent also in the group discussions said,

“Despite different strategies to select beneficiaries, on some extent there are corruption whereby some local leaders (chief of villages) ask people amount of money in order to be included as member beneficiary of the concern worldwide Rwanda and when they refuse they are no longer treated like others in community. This also hinder the development of organization or be unable to achieve its targets due to bad leadership.” Other woman respondent also added, *“.....there is also the time when given the money 85,000 Rwandan francs given to beneficiaries of concern worldwide Rwanda, the leaders ask to give them one bottle of beer ‘kumuha agacupa’ so that you and them can be in good term and if you refuse, they continue to burden you. This also is big obstacle that hinder our development and can cause big problem to the community.”* (Group discussions with concern beneficiaries in Saga cell, 2021).

The fair, effective and qualified leadership is the most important tools to the achievement of organization’s objectives and vision. With bad leadership, the development of organization cannot be achieved effectively and the living conditions of the beneficiaries cannot be achieved. However, the beneficiaries also can be the main causes of project development or loss as stated by the leader of concern worldwide in Muganza sector in the interview with researcher,

“Homelessness is main challenges where beneficiaries who might directly invest in the journey towards out of extreme poverty start by securing own shelter, illiterate do not easily facilitate the capturing of trainings sessions, misuse of support in some cases,are among

the obstacles of development of people beneficiaries of concern worldwide in Muganza sector.” (Interview with concern beneficiaries in Cyumba cell, 2021).

Among the causes of underdevelopment for the beneficiaries of concern worldwide beneficiaries in Muganza sector, despite different strategies include the fact that most of its beneficiaries were homeless people, for this reason the money given to them are used to search homes or place to stay instead of using them in developmental activities. The other reason stated by the respondents is illiteracy, big number of concern worldwide beneficiaries in Muganza sector are illiterate which cause them to be afraid of investing that money in developmental activities and use them in unproductive activities compared to the literate ones. The proper orientation on program approaches to beneficiaries and key stakeholders, development of BCC materials for trainings, Community and LA engagement from planning up to the phase out, close field monitoring to evaluate progress and taking corrective actions accordingly, planning and coordination meetings with partners are among the strategies and action taken by the concern worldwide in Muganza sector leaders to deal with the above challenges for better and effective achievements.

CHAPTER FIVE

DISCUSSIONS

5.1 Introduction

This chapter discusses the findings obtained during the data collection from beneficiaries of concern worldwide in Muganza sector, Gisagara district. The discussions are based on the findings presented in chapter four and the chapter is modeled after the research objectives, literature review and theories of the related literature.

5.2 The overview of graduation program from participants

Program development is an ongoing, comprehensive planning process used to establish projects. Quality program development is supported by a well-thought-out and documented plan of action like concern worldwide Rwanda. The graduation approach focuses on helping the poorest and most vulnerable households develop sustainable livelihoods, increase incomes, and move out of extreme poverty. It consists of a carefully sequenced, multisectoral intervention comprising consumption support (food or cash) to provide the households with a basic safety net and the breathing room to invest in increased income-earning activities; skills training; the means to jump-start an economic activity, through transfer of a productive asset (e.g., milk animals, goats, or chickens) or seed capital for informal self-employment, or access to formal employment; access to savings services and related financial capability building (and sometimes other financial inclusion services); and coaching, mentoring, and group membership to build confidence, reinforce skills, navigate the process, and break down social exclusion (Banerjee, A., et al. 2015).

The intervention is time-bound for each family (generally 24–36 months) to preclude long-term dependence and enable programs to serve additional eligible households. After they complete the program, the still-poor participants will be better able to sustain their gains and continue their upward trajectory if they have continued access to the national social protection system (e.g., social insurance, skills development) and financial inclusion initiatives.

Concern Worldwide is running a version of this model in Rwanda. With poverty reduction being high on the Government of Rwanda's policy priorities, lessons from the Graduation Program are expected to support this effort, and to influence policy debates on graduation, in Rwanda and beyond. The monitoring and evaluation (M&E) component aims to generate useful learning in support of the

Government of Rwanda's Vision 2020 Umurenge Program and the National Social Protection Strategy (WHO, 2018).

Households are targeted for the Graduation Program if they are classified in the bottom two 'Ubudehe' categories (a community-based wealth mapping) and the community confirms that they meet the other eligibility criteria: at least one adult member is able to work, landless or near-landless and homeless, have no cattle, no income-generating activity, no high school or technical diploma, and are not supported by any other project. The qualitative in-depth interviews found that most households have used the cash transfers to improve their family's wellbeing directly (spending more on food, housing, clothing), and to access basic services (education, health). Importantly, they have also invested more in livelihoods (farming, micro-enterprises) and have accumulated productive assets (livestock, land). The investment and asset accumulation effects are especially important as they represent a move towards achieving self-reliance by generating autonomous income, which is one robust indicator of graduation.

The same research reveals that individual households have differential potential for graduation, and that shocks such as illness can undermine households that were on a positive trajectory. It must also be recognized that working with households who were effectively asset less, homeless and had no income-generating activity when the program started is very challenging, and it would be unrealistic to expect a 100% success rate in terms of graduation out of extreme poverty by all of these highly resource-constrained households

5.3 The impacts analysis of graduation program to beneficiaries

The different evaluation of Concern World wide's Graduation Program in Rwanda found rigorous evidence of progress towards 'graduation' out of extreme poverty for the majority of participants, a follow-up study was done to establish if these impacts were sustained and if not, why. Qualitative fieldwork was conducted with households that followed the trajectory of concern worldwide beneficiaries and leaders, also with government officials and Concern staff at Muganza sector, to identify the enablers and constrainers that allowed some participants to succeed while others struggle from vicious circle of poverty.

The research showed improvement in different categories of people, from those who had basic, skills and ability to used given supports for better production and those most vulnerable households, and they enjoyed sustained improvements in three wellbeing dimensions: material, which are food security, asset ownership, access to health insurance, kitchen gardens and relational which includes

participation in community activities and subjective 'self-confidence'. Most vulnerable households experienced improvements in these indicators while participating in the Graduation Program of concern worldwide, thanks to the cash transfers and other assistance they received, which changed their lived effectively.

At the community level, the beneficiaries of concern worldwide have been able in hiring non beneficiaries to work on their houses or their farms, and non-beneficiaries learned from the knowledge transferred to concern beneficiaries by the Graduation Program's training and coaching sessions, which they imitated and increased their living condition as well. One negative side effect of the program was jealousy and resentment by non-beneficiaries towards beneficiaries, which has faded over time but caused some erosion of social capital and social cohesion within communities.

On the research study, the researcher asked beneficiaries respondents to comment on each component of the concern worldwide graduation package. Cash transfers were ranked by the majority as the most important component of concern that have affected their living conditions positively, but the amount was regarded as adequate by some and inadequate by others especially for those who had no place to live before being member beneficiaries of concern. Asset transfers were found to be more effective when delivered during the cash transfers phase, whereby some got livestock and other related supports. Livelihood trainings was highly valued by all beneficiaries, especially business skills and trainings about gender equality, preparation of nitrous food for the family and the benefits of working as family towards economic development that they still apply. The respondents' beneficiaries also valued the home visits and personal coaching and mentoring they received from concern worldwide leaders. Although many respondents learnt a long-term savings habit thanks to the program, most vulnerable people beneficiaries have stopped saving and this component was ranked as the least important of the package. Concern worldwide is accepted as a pioneer of graduation programming in Rwanda, not only by implementing the Graduation Program but also by engaging with social protection working groups and the National Social Protection Strategy. When designing its 'Minimum Package for Graduation' the government learned from Concern's caseworker model and approaches to targeting, asset transfers and training.

CHAPTER SIX

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1. Introduction

The chapter gives overview of overall study, it presents in brief the content of the whole books, draws conclusion and gives the recommendations of the study

6.2. Summary of the study

This research intended to find out the role of graduation programs in reducing extreme poverty in Muganza sector, Gisagara district, as one of the district that have high frequency of people who live in extreme poverty in Rwanda. The chapter one of this study, gives overview of Rwanda situation of living condition of people, the poverty status and gives brief history of graduation program in Rwanda, particularly in southern province, Gisagara district. It has also stated the gap that hider the reduction of poverty among people in Gisagara district despite the implementation of graduation program, which shows unpleasant outcome of the efforts invested in the program. The first objective was to find out the role the Integrated Graduation Program in reduction of extreme poverty in Gisagara District. The second one was to analyze the impact of Integrated Graduation Program in economic development of community in Muganza sector. And find out how Integrated Graduation Program increased the livelihood of people in Muganza sector. While the third objective was to highlight obstacles that hinders the development of people in Muganza sector.

The second chapter gave different reviews from different researchers about the graduation program and poverty reduction strategies. The capability approaches, realism and change theories were used by different scholars to explain and interpret poverty reduction. In this chapter researcher consulted different books about graduation programs around the globe through the consultation of book, journals and reports about these program implementation and achievement in reducing poverty within community. The third one showed different methods used by researcher to get accurate information through different data collection instruments. As, the objectives of this study highlights, the study showed great concern on the implementation of graduation program effectively and consistently in order to help to the high extent in reducing poverty through setting some program activities that fit the localization whereby the program is being implemented.

6.3. Conclusion

The study was to assess the role of graduation program in reduction of extreme poverty among households. The study was conducted in southern province, Gisagara district, in Muganza sector. The findings showed that graduation program is the effective to poverty reduction and contributed to sustainable development. The beneficiaries experience permanent wellbeing improvements after their participation in the projects of organization. One consensus conclusion is that positive graduation trajectories are sustainable for households that made good use of the opportunities provided by concern worldwide Graduation Program, but that the graduation model might not be feasible to scale-up by government to national level, because of its human resource implications and financial costs. The other agreed among concern staff and some respondents' beneficiaries is that many participants have retained most or all of their gains from participation, even some years after leaving the program. However, there are other beneficiaries whose their situation became worse after being graduated. They were used to receiving the money monthly, but they have nothing today, which means that the beneficiaries of the program some have achieved self-reliant livelihoods and others declined, which is a big problem to the organization and to the community in general. Finally, recommendations for improving the Graduation Program performance were suggested, including modifying its design such as extending the duration of support, introducing insurance to protect the gains against shocks, referrals to direct support for those who cannot graduate, strengthening psychosocial support, and working more closely with government.

6.4. Recommendations

To Government and local leaders

- There should be strong collaboration of local leaders and concern worldwide graduation program in order to sustain the program achievement even after the program phase out.
- The local leaders should teach people to use money given by concern in productive way to help them after graduation
- The government should establish other developmental policies and programs to help concern worldwide because the poor people there are many people who need developmental supports in this sector.
- Punish local leaders who use corruption during the beneficiaries' selection.

To the Integrated graduation program

- There should be follow up from the selection up to graduation and even after graduation to know the situation of concern worldwide beneficiaries living condition as the program still working in surrounding sectors.
- The trainings on gender should reach to young generation, single parents so that to increase their relationships with others within community.
- The program should handle the issues of homeless people before they start the implementation of graduation activities.
- The program should make emphasize on social cohesion in order to prevent jealous between community members in working area.

To the community and beneficiaries

- The community should have ownership in helping poor families instead of being jealous to these selected for being supported by any program.
- Beneficiaries have to use the money given by the program productively for better living condition after graduation.
- Beneficiaries should focus on saving in order to leave with something during the graduation period.

REFERENCES

- Akaliza, D.A., Ignatieva, I., Martin, R. & Swatton, J. (2016). Graduation Programme, Rwanda: Adding to the evidence: *a summary of qualitative research*. Kigali: Concern Rwanda.
- Amin, S., Rai, A. S., & Topa, G. (2003). *Does microcredit reach the poor and vulnerable? Evidence from northern Bangladesh*. *Journal of Development Economics*, 70(1), 59–82.
- Armendáriz, B., & Morduch, J. (2010). *The economics of microfinance (2nd ed.)*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.
- Bandiera, O., Burgess, R., Das, N., Gulesci, S., Rasul, I., & Sulaiman, M. (2017). *Labor markets and poverty in village economies*. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 132(2), 811–870.
- Bandiera, O., Burgess, R., Gulesci, S., Rasul, I., & Sulaiman, M. (2013). *Can entrepreneurship programs transform the economic lives of the poor?*
- Banerjee, A., Duflo, E., Chattopadhyay, R., & Shapiro, J. (2016). *The long-term impacts of a 'graduation' program: Evidence from West Bengal*.
- Banerjee, A., Duflo, E., Glennerster, R., & Kinnan, C. (2015). *The miracle of microfinance? Evidence from a randomized evaluation*. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 7(1), 22–53.
- Beegle, A. C, & Monsalve E. (Eds.) (n.d.), *realizing the full potential of social safety nets in Africa (pp. 49–86)*. Washington, DC: World Bank Group.
- Beegle, K., Honorati, M., & Monsalve, E. (2018). *Reaching the poor and vulnerable in Africa through social safety nets*. In K.
- Behrandt, C. (2017). *Can graduation approaches contribute to building social protection floors?* *Policy in Focus*, 14(2), 33–35.
- Blattman, C., Green, E. P., Jamison, J., Lehmann, M. C., & Annan, J. (2016). *The returns to microenterprise support among the ultrapoor: A field experiment in postwar Uganda*. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 8(2), 35–64.
- BRAC (2001) *Challenging the Frontiers of Poverty Reduction: Targeting the Ultra-poor, Targeting Social Constraints*, Dhaka: BRAC.

- Burnside, C., & Dollar, D. (2000), Aid, Policies and Growth. *The American Economic Review*. 90(4): 847-868.
- Carter, M. R., & Barrett, C. B. (2006). *The economics of poverty traps and persistent poverty: An asset-based approach*. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 42(2), 178–199.
- Concern Worldwide (2017) *Concern Worldwide's Graduation Portfolio 2017 – 2021*.
- Concern Worldwide Rwanda (nd). *Targeting Process for the Social Protection Programme*. Kigali: Concern Worldwide Rwanda.
- Devereux, S. & Isimbi, R. (2019) Understanding Graduation Outcomes in Rwanda: Coaching, Relationships and Empowerment in Concern Worldwide's Graduation Programme - Research Report for Concern Worldwide
- Devereux, S. & Sabates, R. (March 2016). Enhancing the Productive Capacity of Extremely Poor People in Rwanda: *Final Evaluation Report*. Brighton: Centre for Social Protection, Institute of Development Studies.
- Devereux, S. & Sabates-Wheeler, R. (March 2015). *Graduating from Social Protection? Editorial Introduction*, *IDS Bulletin*, 46(2): 1–12.
- Devereux, S. (2017). *Do 'graduation' programmes work for Africa's poorest? In D. Lawson, L. Ado-Kofie, & D. Hulme (Eds.), What works for Africa's poorest? Programmes and policies for the extreme poor (pp. 181–203)*. Rugby, UK: Practical Action Publishing Ltd.
- Devereux, S., Roelen, K., Sabates, R., Stoelinga, D. & Dyevre, A. (December 2015). Final Evaluation Report: *Concern's Graduation Model Programme in Burundi*. Brighton: Centre for Social Protection, Institute of Development Studies.
- Easterly, W. (2011). *The Elusive Quest Or Growth: Economists' Adventures and, Vllisa dventures in the Tropics*. Boston: The MIT Press.
- Ghalib, A. K. (2013). *How effective is microfinance in reaching the poorest? Empirical evidence on programme outreach in rural Pakistan*. *Journal of Business Economics and Management*, 14(3), 467–480.
- Halder, S. R., & Mosley, P. (2004). *Working with the ultra-poor: Learning from BRAC experiences*. *Journal of International Development*, 16(3), 387–406.

- Hashemi, S. M. & Umaira, W. (2011) *New Pathways for the Poorest: The Graduation Model from BRAC*, CSP Research Report 10, Brighton: Centre for Social Protection, IDS
- Ismayilova, L., Karimli, L., Sanson, J., Gaveras, E., Nanema, R., Tô-Camier, A., & Chaffin, J. (2018). *Improving mental health among ultra-poor children: Two-year outcomes of a cluster-randomized trial in Burkina Faso*. *Social Science & Medicine*, 208, 180–189.
- Kabonga, I. (2015). “Impact of Donor Aid on Socio-Economic Development: A Case of Chegutu District.” Unpublished Masters Dissertation. Gweru: Midlands State University.
- Karimli, L., Rost, L., & Ismayilova, L. (2018). *Integrating economic strengthening and family coaching to reduce work-related health hazards among children of poor households: Burkina Faso*. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 62(1), S6–S14.
- Kazianga, H., & Udry, C. (2006). *Consumption smoothing? Livestock, insurance and drought in rural Burkina Faso*. *Journal of Development Economics*, 79(2), 413–446.
- Lawson, D., Hulme, D., Matin, I. & Moore, K. (editors) (2010). *What Works for the Poorest? Poverty Reduction Programmes for the World’s Extreme Poor*. Rugby: Practical Action.
- Leatherman, S., & Dunford, C. (2010). *Linking health to microfinance to reduce poverty*. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 88(6), 470–471.
- Mabuto, M., & Mupamhadzi, V. (2013). The Farmer in the York of Effects of Humanitarian Aid on Rural Farmers of Mberengwa Ward 17(20052007) In Zimbabwe. *Greener Journal of Social Sciences* Vol 3(4) 180–186. <https://doi.org/10.15580/GJSS.2013.4.020813441>
- Matin, I., Munshi, S., & Mehnaz, R. (2008). *Crafting a graduation pathway for the ultra poor: Lessons and evidence from a BRAC programme (Working paper No. 109)*. Retrieved from https://www.files.ethz.ch/isn/127450/WP109_Martin.pdf
- Matunhu, J. (2011). “A Critique of Mordenization and Dependency Theories in Africa: Critical Assessment.” *African Journal of History and Culture* Vol 3(5) 65–72.
- Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (2008). *Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy*. Kigali: Republic of Rwanda.

- Montesquiou, A.; Sheldon, T.; DeGiovanni, F. & Hashemi, S. (2014) *From Extreme Poverty to Sustainable Livelihoods: A Technical Guide to the Graduation Approach*, New York NY: CGAP-Ford Foundation
- Mosley, P., Hudson, J., & Verschoor, A., (2004). Aid, Poverty Reduction and the "New Conditionality", *The Economic Journal*, 114 (496); F217— F243.
- Moyo, D. (2009). *Dead Aid: Why Aid Is Not Working and There Is a Way for Africa*. New York: Straus and Giroux.
- Nazneen, R. (1993). "Impact of Foreign Aid in Developing Countries." MA Thesis. Quebec, Concordia University.
- NISR (2012). *The Third Integrated Housing and Living Conditions Survey (EICV): Main Indicators Report*. Kigali: Republic of Rwanda.
- NISR (2012). *The Third Integrated Housing and Living Conditions Survey (EICV): Main Indicators Report*, Kigali: Republic of Rwanda
- Power, R, Langhaug, L. F, Nyamurera, T, Wilson, D, Bassett M. T, & Cowan, F. M. (2004). Developing complex interventions for rigorous evaluation: a case study from rural Zimbabwe Health Education Research Theory & Practice. Vol 19 no.5, 570–575
- Sabates, R. & Abbott, P. (2013). *Graduation Programme in Rusatira and Kibeho Sectors in Huye and Nyaruguru Districts, Rwanda: Baseline Report Cohort 2*. Kigali: Concern Worldwide Rwanda.
- Sabates, R.; Devereux, S. & Abbott, P. (2013) *Enhancing the Productive Capacity of Extremely Poor People in Rwanda: Consolidated Analysis Cohort 1: 12 Months Report*, Kigali: Concern Worldwide Rwanda.
- Sabates-Wheeler, R., Sabates, R. & Devereux, S. (2018) 'Enabling Graduation For Whom? Identifying and Explaining Heterogeneity in Livelihood Trajectories Post-Cash Transfer Exposure' IN *Journal of International Development* DOI: 10.1002/jid.3369.
- Sachs, J. (2005). *The End of Poverty: Economic Possibilities for Our Time*. New York: Penguin Books.

Vinck, P., Brunelli, C., Takenoshita, K. & Chizelema, D. (2009). *Rwanda: Comprehensive Food Security and Vulnerability Analysis*. Rome: World Food Programme.

Wood, R. (1986). *From Marshal Plan to Debt Crisis: Foreign Aid and Development Choices in the World Economy*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

APPENDICES

IBIBAZO BIGENEWE ABAGENERWABIKORWA BA CONCERN WORLDWIDE RWANDA, MU MURENGE WA MUGANZA AKARERE KA GISAGARA/ QUESTION FOR CONCERN WORLDWIDE RWANDA BENEFICIARIES IN MUGANZA SECTOR GISAGARA DISTRICT

Madame/ Bwana/ Madame/ Mister,

Nitwa/ My name is **NIKUZE Aimeline**, umunyeshuri usozza amasomo muri Kaminuza nkuru y'u Rwanda, mu cyiciro cya kabiri cya kaminuza, ishami rya Huye, mu ishami ry'iterambere / Student in University of Rwanda , Master's program, Huye campus in Development studies . Nkaba ndi gukora ubushakashatsi ku bijyanye na *“Uruhare rwa Integrated Graduation Program/Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu kugabanya ikibazo cy'ubukene mu karere ka Gisagara, by'umwihariko mu murenge wa Muganza.”* / I am conducting a research on *“ Analysis of the Impact of Integrated Graduation Program in Poverty Reduction: Case of Concern WorldWide Rwanda in Gisagara District, Muganza sector 2018- 2020”*. Nifuzaga ko mwagira uruhare muri ubu bushakashatsi musubiza ibibazo biri kuri ururupapuro/ I would like that you participate in this research in responding the questions written on this paper. Kwitabira ubu bushakashatsi ni ubushake kandi amakuru udusangiza azagirwa ibanga akoresheye ku bijyanye n'amasomo gusa/ Participation in this research is voluntary and the formation you shared will be confidential, will use this only for academic purpose.

Amabwiriza/ Instructions.

- Soma neza ikibazo/Read carefully the questions before answering
- Shyiraho akamenyetso ka ahabugenewe /put where it is necessary
- Ku bibazo birebire subiriza ahabugenewe/ on the long questions put answers where it is necessary

I. IBIBAZO BY'UMUNTU KU GITI CYE/ QUESTION ADRESSED TO INDIVIDUAL PERSON.

1. Igitsina cy'usubiza/ Gender of respondents:

Gabo/Male

Gore/Female

2. Imyaka y'usubiza/Ages of Respondents

18-28

29-38

39-48

49+

3. Irangamimerere/ Marital Status:

a) Ingaragu/single

b) Yarashatse/married

c) Batandukanye byemewe n'amategeko/divorced

d) Baratandukanye/separated

e) Yarapfakaye/widowed

f) Umugore wibana/ Single mother

g) Umugabo wibana/ Single Father

4. icyo akora/ Occupation of respondents

a) Ntakazi mfite/Non occupation

d) Umucuruzi/ informal trader

b) Umuhinzi/ Farmers

e) Umukozi wa leta/government employee

c) Nkora nyakabyizi/daily worker

5. Amashuri yize /Educational level of respondents

a) Sinize/non educated

b) Nize abanza/ Primary

c) Nize ayisumbuye/ Secondary

d) Nize imyuga n'ubumenyi ngiro/Technical school

e) Nize kaminuza/University

6. Ikigero bishimiye ubufasha bahabwa/ level of Satisfaction

a) Cyo Hejuru/ High

b) Kigereraniye/ Moderate

c) Cyo Hasi/ Lower

7. Muri mu cyiciro cya kangaha cy'ubudehe/ What is your ubudehe classification/

a) A/icya A

b) B/ icya B

c) C/icya C

d) D/ icya D

e) E/ cya E

II. Questions Addressed to Beneficiaries of Concern Worldwide Rwanda, in Muganza Sector/ Ibibazo Byagenewe Abagenerwabikorwa ba Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza.

1.Nk'umugenerwabikorwa wumva ute Concern Worldwide Rwanda?/ In your view as beneficiary, how do you understand Concern Worldwide Rwanda

.....
.....
.....

2. Ni gute abagenerwabikorwa ba Concern Worldwide Rwanda batorwa mu murenge wa Muganza?/ How beneficiaries of Concern Worldwide Rwanda are selected in Muganza sector

.....
.....
.....
.....

3. Ni iyihe mirimo Concern Worldwide Rwanda yibandaho mu kugabanya ubukene mu murenge wa Muganza?/ In which activities do Concern Worldwide Rwanda focus on to help in poverty reduction in Muganza sector/

.....
.....
.....

1. Kuva waba umwe mubagenerwabikorwa ba Concern Worldwide Rwanda ni iki imibereho yawe yiyongereyeho?/ From the time you become one of beneficiaries of Concern Worldwide Rwanda, how did your health and wellbeing increased/

.....
.....
.....

2. Ni akahe kamaro/ uruhare rwa Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu kurandura ubusumba nka kimwe mubitera ubukene bukabije mu murenge wa Muganza?/ What are impacts of Concern Worldwide Rwanda to the eradication of gender discrimination as one of factors of poverty increase in Muganza sector/

.....
.....
.....

3. Ni gute abagenerwabikorwa bungukira muri Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza?/ How beneficiaries benefit from the Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector?

.....
.....
.....

4. Ni izihe nzitizi muhura nazo muri Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza?/ What are the major challenges found in Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector/

.....
.....
.....

5. Ni iyihe nama watanga mu kongera imikorere ya Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza?/ What can you recommend to increase the performance of the Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector/

.....
.....
.....

**IBIBAZO BIGENEWE ABAKOZI BA CONCERN MU MURENGE WA MUGANZA/
QUESTIONS RESERVED TO EMPLOYEES IN CONCERN WORLDWIDE RWANDA IN
MUGANZA SECTOR**

1. Mugihe umaze ukorana na Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector ni mpinduka ki waba warabonye mumurenge?/ Since you started working with Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector, what have you seen as improvement in this sector?

.....
.....
.....

2. Ni bufasha ki Concern Worldwide Rwanda iha abagenerwabikorwa mu murenge wa Muganza?/ What kind of supports Concern Worldwide Rwanda gives the beneficiaries in Muganza sector.

.....
.....
.....

3. Nibihe bibazo by'imibanire n'ubukungu byakemuwe na Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza?/ What are social and economic problems solved by Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector?

.....
.....
.....

4. Ni ibiki bigenderwaho muguhitamo abagenerwabikorwa ba Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza?/ What criteria do you follow in selecting the beneficiaries of Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector?/

.....
.....
.....

5. Ni ryari graduation yatangiye ibikorwa mu murenge wa Muganza?/ When does graduation take place in Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector?/

.....
.....
.....

6. Ni iki mugenderaho kugira ngo mwemeze ko umuntu yavuye mucyiciro cy'ubukene ajya mucyisumbuyeho?/ What criteria do you follow to decide that someone have successfully came from one level of poverty to another?/

.....
.....
.....

7. Ni iki cyakorwa mu kongera abagenerwabikorwa ba Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza sector?/ What can be done to increase the beneficiaries of Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector?/

.....
.....
.....

8. Nizihe nama watanga kuri Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza sector?/ kugirango irusheho Gukora neza?/ What can you recommend to Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector to increase its performance/

.....
.....

THANK YOU !!

(MURAKOZE!!)

**IBIBAZO BIGENEWE ABAYOBOZI BA CONCERN WORLD WIDE RWANDA/
INTERVIEW GUIDE TO LEADERS OF CONCERN WORLDWIDE RWANDA.**

1. Nk'umuyobozi, dushushanyirize muri make Concern Worldwide Rwanda?/ As leader, describe briefly the Concern Worldwide Rwanda?/
2. Ni buryo ki Concern Worldwide Rwanda ikoresha mukurandura ubukenye nk'imwe mu ntego nyamukuru zayo?/ One of the mission of Concern Worldwide Rwanda is poverty eradication, what strategies do you use to eradicate poverty in Muganza sector?/
3. Ni gute muhitamo abagenerwabikorwa ba Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge/ How do you select beneficiaries of Concern Worldwide Rwanda in Muganza sector? wa Muganza?
4. Ni ibiki byagezweho uhereye igihe mwatangiriye gushyirira mubikorwa imirimo ya Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza?/ What have you achieved since you started implementing Concern Worldwide Rwanda activities in Muganza sector?/
5. Ni izihe mbogamizi muhura nazo mugihe mushyira mubikorwa imirimo ya Concern Worldwide Rwanda mu murenge wa Muganza?/ What obstacles do you face during the implementation of your activities in Muganza sector?/
6. Ni ngamba ki mwafashe nk'abayobozi ba Concern Worldwide Rwanda, muguhangana n'izo mbogamizi? What decisions or solutions have you taken as leader in Concern Worldwide Rwanda, to deal with those obstacles?

THANK YOU!!

MURAKOZE!!